



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 25, 2012

Ms. M. Ann Montgomery-Moran
Assistant Ellis County & District Attorney
109 S. Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2012-05896

Dear Ms. Montgomery-Moran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 451642.

The Ellis County Sheriff’s Office (the “sheriff’s office”) received a request for all arrest and incident reports involving two named individuals and a specified address prior to 2012. You indicate you will redact the motor vehicle information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code¹ and the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request as it does not pertain to the named individuals or the address specified in the request. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the sheriff’s office need not release such information in response to the request.

¹On September 1, 2011, the Texas legislature amended section 552.130 to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3), without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. Gov’t Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *Id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the sheriff’s office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individuals at issue. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individuals’ right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff’s office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff’s office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.³ We note the sheriff’s office has submitted information that does not depict either of the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. These reports do not constitute a criminal history compilation protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld on that basis under section 552.101.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information you have marked relates to concluded cases that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to information you have marked.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.⁴

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/em

Ref: ID# 451642

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.