



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 27, 2012

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2012-06055

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 452054 (#HABS020812).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for any records pertaining to two named individuals. You state the department has released some of the responsive information. You claim the remaining responsive information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *See id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the privacy rights of these individuals. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You raise common-law and constitutional privacy for Exhibit C. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See* 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has also found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find that portions of Exhibit C are highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See id.* at 4. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *See id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). In this instance, you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information in Exhibit C falls within the zones of privacy or implicates privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state, or another state or country, is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). The department must withhold the driver's license and motor

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

vehicle record information we have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information in Exhibit C.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenneth Leland Conyer
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLC/dls

Ref: ID# 452054

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)