



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 7, 2012

Ms. Jena R. Abel
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Board of Nursing
333 Guadalupe Street, Suite 3-460
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2012-06669

Dear Ms. Abel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 452781.

The Texas Board of Nursing (the "board") received a request for information concerning investigations into and disciplinary action against a named nurse. You state the board does not maintain information concerning disciplinary action against the named nurse. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 301.466 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

(a) A complaint and investigation concerning a nurse under this subchapter and all information and material compiled by the board in connection with the complaint and investigation are:

(1) confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]; and

(2) not subject to disclosure, discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for release to anyone other than the board or board employee or agent involved in license holder discipline.

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), information regarding a complaint and an investigation may be disclosed to:

(1) a person involved with the board in a disciplinary action against the nurse;

(2) a nursing licensing or disciplinary board in another jurisdiction;

(3) a peer assistance program approved by the board under Chapter 467, Health and Safety Code;

(4) a law enforcement agency; or

(5) a person engaged in bona fide research, if all information identifying a specific individual has been deleted.

(c) The filing of formal charges against a nurse by the board, the nature of those charges, disciplinary proceedings of the board, and final disciplinary actions, including warnings and reprimands, by the board are not confidential and are subject to disclosure in accordance with [the Act].

Occ. Code § 301.466. You state the submitted information consists of documents created by the board in connection with a board investigation of the named nurse. However, we note a portion of the information you seek to withhold consists of the formal charge filed by the board against the nurse during its investigation. Subsection 301.466(c) provides this information is not confidential under subsection 301.466(a)(1). Consequently, the board may not withhold information pertaining to the formal charge filed by the board against the named nurse, which we have marked, pursuant to section 301.466(a)(1). Based on your representations and our review, we agree the remaining information at issue is confidential under section 301.466(a). We find the requestor is not entitled to receive the remaining information under section 301.466(b) and the remaining information does not fall under section 301.466(c). Therefore, with the exception of the information subject to section 301.466(c), which we have marked, we conclude the board must withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466(a)(1) of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency.” Gov’t Code § 552.111. Section 552.111 encompasses the deliberative

process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of this exception is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, orig. proceeding); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1–2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, orig. proceeding). We determined section 552.111 exempts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, opinions, recommendations, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body's policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body's policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body's policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995). Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events that are severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, the factual information also may be withheld under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked pertaining to the formal charges filed against the named nurse does not reflect advice, opinion, or recommendations on a broad policy-making matter. Accordingly, the board may not withhold this information under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the board must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466 of the Occupations Code. The information we have marked must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Neal Falgoust". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "N".

Neal Falgoust
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NF/ag

Ref: ID# 452781

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)