



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

May 7, 2012

Ms. Donna Johnson  
Olson & Olson L.L.P.  
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600  
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2012-06692

Dear Ms. Johnson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 452818 (MAN-APP).

The City of Manvel (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a specified city police officer. You state you will redact information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009)<sup>1</sup> and sections 552.130<sup>2</sup>, 552.136<sup>3</sup>, and 552.147<sup>4</sup> of the

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including the e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code and an L-3 declaration under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306(b) of the Occupations Code, without the necessity of requesting an opinion from this office.

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the motor vehicle record information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3), including a copy of a driver's license, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c); *see also id.* § 552.130(d)-(e) (requestor may appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information under section 552.130(c) to attorney general and governmental body withholding information pursuant to section 552.130(c) must provide certain notice to requestor).

<sup>3</sup>Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact from the requested information it discloses, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number. Gov't Code § 552.136(c) (governmental body may redact information described by subsection 552.136(b) from any information the governmental body discloses without necessity of requesting decision from attorney general); *see id.* (entitling requestor to appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information pursuant to section 552.136(c) to attorney general); *id.* (requiring governmental body that withholds information pursuant to section 552.136(c) to provide notice to requestor).

<sup>4</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Government Code. You claim the remaining information at issue is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.115, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court considered the applicability of section 552.102 and held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 347-48 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the submitted information contains a date of birth subject to section 552.102. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102 of the Government Code. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.102(a), and the city may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including the Driver’s Privacy Protection Act of 1994 (the “DPPA”), 18 U.S.C. §§ 2721-2725. Section 2721 provides, in part:

(a) In general.—A State department of motor vehicles, and any officer, employee, or contractor thereof, shall not knowingly disclose or otherwise make available to any person or entity:

(1) personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(3), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section; or

(2) highly restricted personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(4), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, without the express consent of the person to whom such information applies, except uses permitted in subsections (b)(1), (b)(4), (b)(6), and (b)(9)[.]

(b) Permissible uses.—Personal information referred to in subsection (a) . . . subject to subsection (a)(2), may be disclosed as follows:

(1) For use by any government agency . . . in carrying out its functions[.]

...

(c) Resale or redisclosure.—An authorized recipient of personal information (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11) or (12)) may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under subsection (b) (but not for uses under subsection (b) (11) or (12)). . . . Any authorized recipient (except a recipient under subsection (b) (11)) that resells or rediscloses personal information covered by this chapter must keep for a period of 5 years records identifying each person or entity that receives information and the permitted purpose for which the information will be used and must make such records available to the motor vehicle department upon request.

18 U.S.C. § 2721(a)-(c). Section 2721(a) is applicable to state departments of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(a). Pursuant to section 2721(b), personal information may be disclosed to certain entities by a state department of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(b). You state the submitted information contains information protected under the DPPA. However, we find the city is not a state department of motor vehicles. Further, you do not state the city received the information at issue from a state department of motor vehicles. Therefore, you have failed to demonstrate any of the submitted information is subject to section 2721(a) of the DPPA. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by Sections 730.005–730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the city compiles or maintains motor vehicle records; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the city.

Pursuant to section 730.007, personal information may be disclosed to an authorized recipient under certain circumstances, including a governmental agency collecting information to carry out its functions. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(I). Section 730.013 of the Transportation Code provides for purposes of chapter 730 of the Transportation Code:

(a) An authorized recipient of personal information may not resell or redisclose the personal information in the identical or a substantially identical format the personal information was disclosed to the recipient by the applicable agency.

(b) An authorized recipient of personal information may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under Section 730.007.

*Id.* § 730.013(a), (b). You do not represent the city received the information at issue from an agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records for purposes of section 730.013. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any part of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 730.013 of the

Transportation Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 478 at 2 (1987) (language of confidentiality statute controls scope of protection).

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. CHRI also does not include driving record information. Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B). We find the submitted information contains CHRI. The city must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by DPS concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides in part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual’s name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the open records law, Chapter 552.

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

*Id.* § 411.192(a)-(b). We have marked information related to a concealed handgun license. The city appears to have obtained that information from DPS. In this instance, the requestor is neither a criminal justice agency nor the license holder whose information is at issue. Further, we note section 411.193 is not applicable in this instance. *See id.* § 411.193 (making statistical report including number of licenses issued, denied, revoked, or suspended during the preceding month available to the public). Therefore, the city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Common-law privacy encompasses the specific types of information held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. *See* 540 S.W.2d at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). This office has also found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Further, this office has found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not a matter of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.115(a) of the Government Code provides "[a] birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021[.]" Gov't Code § 552.115. Section 552.115 only applies to information maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration official. The city is not the Bureau of Vital Statistics or a local registration official; therefore, the city may not withhold the submitted birth certificate under section 552.115. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982).

Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 of the Government Code or

section 552.1175 of the Government Code.<sup>5</sup> Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). The submitted information contains information, including a cellular telephone number, subject to section 552.117(a)(2). The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information related to a motor vehicle operator's license or driver's license, title, or registration issued by a Texas agency, or an agency of another state or country, is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 411.083 of the Government Code; (2) section 411.192 of the Government Code; and (3) common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.117(a)(2) and 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jessica Marsh  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JM/em

---

<sup>5</sup>"Peace officer" is defined by article 2.12 of the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure.

Ref: ID# 452818

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)