



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

May 10, 2012

Ms. J. Middlebrooks  
Assistant City Attorney  
Criminal Law and Police Division  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-06949

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 453098 (DPD Public Information Request No. 2012-02113).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to eleven specified incidents and all incident reports for calls for service to a specified address relating to assault, public intoxication, and alcohol violations during a specified time period. We understand the department will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

<sup>2</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

The submitted information includes the telephone numbers and address of 9-1-1 callers. In Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-17075 (2011) and 2011-18466 (2011), this office issued previous determinations to the department authorizing the department to withhold the originating telephone number and address, respectively, of a 9-1-1 caller furnished to the department by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this office. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(a)*; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). We understand the telephone numbers and address in the submitted information are the originating telephone numbers and address of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772. As such, the department must withhold the telephone numbers and address you have marked in accordance with the previous determinations issued to the department in Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-17075 and 2011-18466.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to a pending criminal investigation. You also state the department’s assault unit and the Rockwall County District Attorney’s Office, the prosecuting agency, object to the release of the information at issue. Based on these representations and our review of the information, we conclude release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court describes law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, the department may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411,

subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. Upon review, we find the information you have marked constitutes CHRI. Thus, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Further, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find most of the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information you seek to withhold, which we have marked for release, is not highly intimate or embarrassing information of no legitimate public interest and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the

department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must withhold the telephone numbers and address of the 9-1-1 caller you have marked in accordance with the previous determinations issued to the department in Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-17075 and 2011-18466. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code (1) the information you have marked in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and (2) with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the information you have marked and the additional information we have marked in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ACV/ag

Ref: ID# 453098

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)