



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 16, 2012

Ms. Cheryl K. Byles
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2012-07252

Dear Ms. Byles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 453846 (City of Fort Worth PIR No. W015099).

The Fort Worth Human Relations Unit (the "unit") received a request for a specified investigation file. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You state the submitted information was compiled by the unit of the City of Fort Worth (the "city") in the course of the unit's investigation of an employment discrimination claim filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code. *See* Labor Code § 21.201 (person claiming to be aggrieved by unlawful employment practice or person's agent may file complaint with Texas Workforce Commission ("TWC")). You state the unit was created under chapter 21 of the Labor Code. *See id.* § 21.152 (providing for creation of local commissions). We also understand pursuant to chapter 21, both the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and the TWC have deferred jurisdiction to hear complaints to the unit. *See id.* § 21.154 (authorizing deferral of jurisdiction to local commissions); *see also* 40 T.A.C. § 819.76 (authorizing workshare agreements between the TWC and local commissions). Thus, under section 21.152 of the Labor Code, the unit is a local agency authorized to investigate and resolve complaints of employment discrimination. *See* Labor Code §§ 21.154 (authorizing local commission to which complaint is referred or jurisdiction is deferred to receive, investigate, conciliate, or rule on complaint), .204 (relating to investigation of complaints by the TWC).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. Section 21.304 of the Labor Code, which relates to public release of information obtained by the TWC, provides as follows:

An officer or employee of the [TWC] may not disclose to the public information obtained by the [TWC] under Section 21.204 except in compliance with section 21.305 and as necessary to the conduct of a proceeding under this chapter.

Labor Code § 21.304. We note the submitted information pertains to a complaint of unlawful employment discrimination that was filed with the unit. Thus, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 21.304 of the Labor Code. However, the requestor is an attorney representing a party to the complaint filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code. Section 21.305 of the Labor Code concerns the release of records to a party to a complaint filed under section 21.201 of the Labor Code and provides as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (c), the [TWC] shall adopt rules allowing a party to a complaint filed under Section 21.201 reasonable access to [TWC] records relating to the complaint.

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), unless the complaint is resolved through a voluntary settlement or conciliation, on the written request of a party the executive director shall allow the party access to the [TWC] records:

(1) after the final action of the [TWC]; or

(2) if a civil action relating to the complaint is filed in federal court alleging a violation of federal law.

(c) Notwithstanding Section 552.023, Government Code, the following information is not considered public information for the purposes of Chapter 552, Government Code, and may not be disclosed to a party to a complaint filed under Section 21.201:

(1) identifying information of persons other than the parties and witnesses to the complaint;

(2) identifying information about confidential witnesses, including any confidential statement given by the witness;

(3) sensitive medical information about the charging party or a witness to the complaint that is:

(A) provided by a person other than the person requesting the information; and

(B) not relevant to issues raised in the complaint, including information that identifies injuries, impairments, pregnancies, disabilities, or other medical conditions that are not obviously apparent or visible;

(4) identifying information about a person other than the charging party that is found in sensitive medical information regardless of whether the information is relevant to the complaint;

(5) nonsensitive medical information that is relevant to the complaint if the disclosure would result in an invasion of personal privacy, unless the information is generally known or has been previously reported to the public;

(6) identifying information about other respondents or employers not a party to the complaint;

(7) information relating to settlement offers or conciliation agreements received from one party that was not conveyed to the other and information contained in a separate alternative dispute resolution file prepared for mediation purposes; and

(8) identifying information about a person on whose behalf a complaint was filed if the person has requested that the person's identity as a complaining party remain confidential.

(d) In this section, "identifying information" has the meaning assigned by Section 32.51, Penal Code.

Id. § 21.305. You do not indicate the complaint was resolved through a voluntary settlement or conciliation agreement. Further, you inform us that final agency action has been taken regarding the complaint. We note subsection 21.305(c) identifies eight categories of information not considered public information for the purposes of chapter 552 and which may not be disclosed to a party to a complaint filed under section 21.201. Pursuant to section 21.305, the requestor, as a party to the complaint, generally has a right of access to the unit's records relating to the complaint. However, the unit must withhold the information subject to subsection (c) under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.305(a).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 21.207(b) of the Labor Code, which provides as follows:

(b) Without the written consent of the complainant and respondent, the [TWC], its executive director, or its other officers or employees may not disclose to the public information about the efforts in a particular case to resolve an alleged discriminatory practice by conference, conciliation, or persuasion, regardless of whether there is a determination of reasonable cause.

Id. § 21.207(b). As previously noted, the unit is a local agency authorized to investigate and resolve complaints of employment discrimination under chapter 21 of the Labor Code. You indicate that some of the submitted information is related to the unit's efforts to mediate the dispute. You do not indicate the unit has received the required written consent of both parties to the charge to release the information at issue. Therefore, the information subject to section 21.207(b) of the Labor Code must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, which provides that an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). The release of the submitted I-9 form in response to this request for information would be for purposes other than for enforcement of the referenced federal statutes. Section 1324a, as a federal law, preempts any conflicting state provisions, including section 21.305 of the Labor Code. *See Equal Employment Opportunity Comm'n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). Accordingly, the submitted I-9 form we have marked is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and may be released only for purposes of compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

The unit raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for portions of the remaining information.¹ The unit also raises section 552.137 of the Government Code for portions of this information. We note, however, section 552.137 is a general exception to disclosure under the Act. A specific statutory right of access prevails over the common-law and general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.)

¹Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976).

(statutory provision controls and preempts common-law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common-law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information). Because the requestor has a statutory right of access to the information at issue in this instance, the unit may not withhold any of this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy or section 552.137.

In summary, the unit must withhold the information subject to section 21.207(b) of the Labor Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The submitted I-9 form we have marked is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and may be released only for purposes of compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. Except as provided by subsection 21.305(c) of the Labor Code, the unit must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenneth Leland Conyer
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLC/dls

²Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, if the unit receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the unit must again seek a decision from this office.

Ms. Cheryl K. Byles - Page 6

Ref: ID# 453846

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)