



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 4, 2012

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-08474

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 459236 (PIR: 2012-04970).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to service numbers 92787-Z and 92788-Z. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). You state the department received

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

the request for information on April 26, 2012. Accordingly, the department's ten-business-day deadline was May 10, 2012. However, you did not submit your request for a decision until May 11, 2012. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

A governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the waiver of its claims under the exceptions at issue, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977).

You claim an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception that may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 52.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department's claim under section 552.108 is not a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness under section 552.302. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, your claim under section 552.130 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption.² Accordingly, we will consider whether any of the submitted information must be withheld under section 552.101 or section 552.130.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision" and encompasses information made confidential by statute. Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). The requestor has not provided the department with two of the three requisite pieces of

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information specified by the statute. Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(2). We agree the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold (1) the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code, and (2) the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 459236

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)