ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 6, 2012

Ms. Sandi P. Tarski
Counsel for Birdville Independent School District
Walsh, Anderson, Gallegos, Green and Trevino, P.C.
P.O. Box 168046
Irving, Texas 75016

OR2012-08642

Dear Ms. Tarski:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 455637.

The Birdville Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for the education records of the requestor's child, and any information during a specified time period concerning the child but not found in the education records.[1] You state the district has redacted student-identifying information pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code.[2]

---

[1]You state, and provide documentation showing, the district sought and received clarification of the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (stating if information requested is unclear or large amount has been requested, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify or narrow request, but may not inquire into purpose for which information will be used); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380 (Tex. 2010) (holding when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

[2]The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. The DOE has determined that FERPA determinations must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education records. We have posted a copy of the letter from the DOE to this office on the Attorney General's website: http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/20060725usdoe.pdf.

You state some information has been released to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.107 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

You acknowledge the submitted information consists of student education records subject to the federal Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "education records"). You also acknowledge the requestor, as a parent of the child whose education records are at issue, generally has a right of access under FERPA to his own child's education records. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(1)(A); *see also* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "parent"). You contend, however, Attachment C is confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code and the federal Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act ("CAPTA"). Thus, you assert section 261.201 and CAPTA prevail over the requestor's right of access under FERPA.

CAPTA conditions federal grant funding for state child abuse prevention and treatment programs on the fulfillment of certain eligibility criteria and requires states to adopt methods to preserve the confidentiality of information concerning child abuse and neglect. *See* 42 U.S.C. §§ 5106a(b)(1)(A), 5106a(b)(2)(B)(viii). Chapter 261 of the Family Code was enacted in accordance with CAPTA. Information pertaining to reports or investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

The Family Compliance Office (the "compliance office") of the United States Department of Education, which is responsible for interpreting and construing FERPA, has addressed the interplay between a parent's right of access under FERPA and the confidentiality provisions of section 261.201. The compliance office found section 261.201 was promulgated pursuant to CAPTA, so that any statutory conflict would thus be between the two federal statutes, FERPA and CAPTA, rather than FERPA and the state statute, section 261.201. *See* Letter from Leroy S. Rooker, Director, Family Policy Compliance Office, U.S. Department of Education, to Stacy Ferguson, Attorney, Schulman, Walheim & Heidelberg (Oct. 10, 1997). After reviewing FERPA and CAPTA, the compliance office concluded CAPTA governs, being the later enacted statute, and thus the CAPTA-compliant Texas Family Code provision concerning reports and investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect prevails over FERPA. *Id.* Based on the compliance office's determination that CAPTA prevails over FERPA, we will address your claim that Attachment C is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides in part:

> (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:
>
> > (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
> >
> > (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.
>
> . . .
>
> (k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency . . . on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k); *see id.* §§ 101.003 (defining child for purposes of Family Code title 5), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261). You contend Attachment C was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Although the district is not an agency authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 261, section 261.406 of the Family Code authorizes the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services ("DFPS") and law enforcement agencies to conduct investigations involving public schools under chapter 261. *See id.* §§ 261.103 (listing agencies that may conduct investigations under Fam. Code ch. 261), .406 (investigations in schools). Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. We note section 261.201(k) permits the investigating agency to release information relating to an investigation under chapter 261 to a parent of the child who was the subject of the alleged or suspected abuse or neglect, unless the parent is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, although the requestor is a parent of the child concerned, section 261.201(k) is not applicable because the district is not the agency that conducted the investigation. We therefore conclude the district must

withhold Attachment C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.[3]

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services" to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, *id.*, meaning it was "not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication." *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the intent of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, orig. proceeding). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state Attachment B consists of communications between individuals you have identified as district employees and attorneys for the district. You state the communications were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of legal services, and were intended to be, and

---

[3]We note a parent or legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect may have a right of access to certain abuse and neglect records maintained by DFPS. Section 261.201(g) of the Family Code provides that DFPS, upon request and subject to its own rules, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section if [DFPS] has edited the information to protect the confidentiality of the identity of the person who made the report and any other person whose life or safety may be endangered by the disclosure. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(g).

have remained, confidential. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to Attachment B. Accordingly, the district may withhold Attachment B under section 552.107 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold Attachment C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code and may withhold Attachment B under section 552.107 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Misty Haberer Barham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHB/som

Ref: ID# 455637

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)