



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 12, 2012

Ms. Cara Leahy White
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107-4654

OR2012-09031

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 455958.

The Euless Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual's arrest. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c). The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e). Section 51.02 of the Family Code defines "child" as "a person who is: (A) ten years of age or older and under 17 years of age; or (B) seventeen years of age or older and under 18 years of age who is alleged or found to have engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision as a result of acts committed before becoming 17 years of age." *Id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted report pertains to juvenile delinquent conduct occurring after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct"). Therefore, the submitted report is subject to section 58.007(c). Although you state the requestor has a right of access to the submitted report pursuant to section 58.007(e), we note the individual you have identified as the requestor's child is not a juvenile suspect or offender who was at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age at the time of the incident to which the information pertains. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Thus, section 58.007(e) is not applicable and the submitted report must generally be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note, however, the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and for the confidential use of certain specified entities. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with two of the requisite pieces of information specified by the statute.

Although the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code, section 550.065(c)(4) requires the accident report to be released to

the requestor because he supplied the required information. Therefore, there is a conflict between the provisions of section 58.007 of the Family Code and section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 58.007 generally pertains to all juvenile law enforcement records, section 550.065(c)(4) specifically pertains to accident reports. Therefore, in this instance, section 550.065 governs the release of the submitted accident report.

Although you seek to withhold the accident report under section 552.108 of the Government Code, statutes governing the release of specific information prevail over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Accordingly, the accident report may not be withheld under section 552.108. You also assert portions of the accident report are confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or county. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). A statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in Act in applicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 of the Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451 (1986). As mentioned above, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the accident report we have marked for release under section 552.130. Therefore, the department must release this accident report in its entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4).

In summary, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. The remaining information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/bs

Ref: ID# 455958

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)