



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 12, 2012

Ms. Tiffany N. Evans
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
Legal Department
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2012-09035

Dear Ms. Evans:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 456117 (GC No. 19498).

The Houston Police Department (the “department”) received a request for a specified incident report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department failed to meet the statutory deadlines imposed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body’s failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential by law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). You raise section 552.101 of the Government Code, which can provide a compelling reason to withhold information. Accordingly, we will address its applicability to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). We agree the submitted report was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse under chapter 261. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Therefore, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. In this instance, however, the requestor is a parent of a child victim listed in the report and is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. The department thus may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold the submitted information from this requestor. *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, subsections 261.201(l)(1) and (3) provide that, before information may be released under section 261.201(k), identifying information of the reporting party and of any juvenile victim or witness who is not a child of the requestor must be redacted. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(1), (3). Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under subsections 261.201(l)(1) and (3). In addition, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information otherwise excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Therefore, pursuant to section 261.201(l)(2), we will address your remaining argument against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one’s current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes CHRI. The department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We note the requestor is a parent of an alleged child victim, and thus has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to information regarding her child that would otherwise be excepted from public disclosure under laws intended to protect the child's privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Therefore, the department may not withhold from this requestor information that pertains only to her child. However, we find the information we have marked in the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. The department must withhold this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note a portion of the remaining information is protected by section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *Id.* § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subsections 261.201(1)(1) and (3) of the Family Code, chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law, and common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to this requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²As noted, the requestor in this instance has a special right of access to the information being released. Accordingly, if the department should receive another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again request a ruling from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Misty Haberer Barham".

Misty Haberer Barham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHB/bs

Ref: ID# 456117

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)