



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 15, 2012

Mr. B. Chase Griffith  
Counsel for the City of McKinney  
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.  
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800  
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2012-09273

Dear Mr. Griffith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 456329 (ORR# 10-5253).

The McKinney Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a named department employee. You state you have provided some of the requested information to the requestor. You also state the department will redact information pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001), which is a previous determination by this office authorizing a governmental body to redact information subject to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 670 allows a governmental body to withhold home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone numbers, personal pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers under section 552.117 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under section 552.301. ORD 670 at 6.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.306 provides in part:

(a) The [Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education (“TCLEOSE”)] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCLEOSE]. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a)-(b). We have marked L-2 and L-3 declarations the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You assert some of the submitted information is subject to section 261.201(a). We note, however, the information at issue pertains to an internal affairs investigation. We find you have failed to demonstrate that any of the information at issue is a report of alleged or suspected child abuse or was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, section 261.201(a) is not applicable to any of the information at issue, and no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that state agencies obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information in accordance with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may only release CHRI to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. However, we note driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See id.* § 411.082 (2)(B) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). We also note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one’s current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in the criminal justice system). Upon review, we conclude the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 and federal law. However, we find no portion of the remaining information constitutes CHRI, and none of it may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411.

---

<sup>2</sup>Although you also raise section 411.085 of the Government Code, that provision merely provides the penalties for the “Unauthorized Obtaining, Use, or Disclosure of Criminal History Record Information.” Gov’t Code § 411.085. Section 411.083 is applicable to the dissemination of CHRI.

The public availability of fingerprints is governed by chapter 560 of the Government Code. Section 560.003 states “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) (“biometric identifier” means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). Section 560.002 states “[a] governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual . . . may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless . . . the individual consents to the disclosure[.]” *Id.* § 560.002(1)(A). We have marked fingerprints the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *See id.* at 681-82. This office has found financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992)* (personal financial information protected by common-law privacy includes designation of beneficiary of employee’s retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). However, there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See ORD 600 at 9* (information revealing employee participates in group insurance plan funded partly or wholly by governmental body not excepted from disclosure); *see also Open Records Decision Nos. 545* (financial information pertaining to receipt of funds from governmental body or debts owed to governmental body not protected by common-law privacy), 523 (1989). Whether financial information is subject to a legitimate public interest and therefore not protected by common-law privacy must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See Open Records Decision No. 373 (1983)*. Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information on this basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of

personal privacy.”<sup>3</sup> Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts*. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Having carefully reviewed the information at issue, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code states “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act],” unless the owner of the e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure or the e-mail address falls within the scope of section 552.137(c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). We have marked an e-mail address the department must withhold under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law, section 560.003 of the Government Code, and common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.102(a), 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail

---

<sup>3</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

address has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure.<sup>4</sup> The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/som

Ref: ID# 456329

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>4</sup>We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination issued by this office authorizing all governmental bodies to withhold ten categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision, including L-2 and L-3 declarations under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code; a fingerprint under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code; and an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code.