



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 20, 2012

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2012-09469

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 456731 (PIR No. W015924).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for all police reports and call sheets from a specified residence or concerning three named individuals from a specified time period. You state social security numbers will be redacted pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, seeks any records concerning three named individuals. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individuals' rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, that you have submitted information in which the named individuals are not listed as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate the individuals' rights to privacy. Accordingly, we will address your arguments for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct and conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). For

purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the information we have marked involves children allegedly engaged in delinquent conduct and conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to this information. Thus, the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and the city must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). You state some of the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Upon review, we find the information at issue relates to an attempted kidnapping. You have not explained how this information was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Therefore, we conclude section 261.201 is not applicable to the information at issue. Thus, the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 on that basis.

As previously noted, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses common-law privacy. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs,

illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information, which we have marked, are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the city must withhold this information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You indicate some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² You also inform us the remaining information contains additional motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country and information related to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We note, however, the issuing state of a driver's license is not motor vehicle record information for purposes of section 552.130. Therefore, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.130.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code and common-law privacy. The city must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

²The Texas legislature amended section 552.130 of the Government Code effective September 1, 2011, to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 permits a governmental body to redact Texas license plate numbers, which are made confidential by section 552.130(a)(2), without requesting an attorney general decision.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Casterline', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/som

Ref: ID# 456731

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)