



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 29, 2012

Ms. Elizabeth L. White
For City of League City
Ross, Banks, May, Cron & Cavin, P.C.
2 Riverway, Suite 700
Houston, Texas 77056

OR2012-10062

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 457801 (LCPD File No. PIR# 1953).

The League City Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all audio recordings of 9-1-1 or emergency calls, call reports, written transcripts, notes, logs, documents, and computer data generated in connection with a specified car accident. You state you are releasing front page information to the requestor.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted documents include a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. See Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *Id.* § 550.065(b).

¹We assume that the basic information you have released is the basic information referred to under section 552.108(c) of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.108(c) (basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted under section 552.108); see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information).

Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with the requisite pieces of information. Although you seek to withhold portions of this information under sections 552.108 and 552.136 of the Government Code, we note information that is specifically made public by statute may not be withheld from the public under any of the general exceptions to public disclosure under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 544 (1990), 378 (1983), 161 (1977), 146 (1976). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information in the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 552.108 or section 552.136 of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.130 of the Government Code to withhold information in the submitted CR-3 accident report. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or county. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Upon review, we find the marked CR-3 accident report form contains information subject to section 552.130. As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 of the Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451.

In this instance, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue in this request, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the CR-3 accident report form under section 552.130. Therefore, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report form in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

You seek to withhold the remaining information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the remaining submitted information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable and the release of the information in Exhibit A and Exhibit C would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

As you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. We note basic information includes the identity and description of the complainant and a detailed description of the offense, but does not include motor vehicle information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense and arrest information, which you state you are releasing, you may withhold Exhibit A and Exhibit C from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1).²

We note, however, Exhibit B consists of a copy of a traffic citation. Because a copy of this document has been provided to the person who received the citation, we find that the release of the information on the citation will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1).

Next, we address your claim for the citation under section 552.103 of the Government Code, which provides in part:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information under section 552.103 of the Government Code, except to note basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Id. § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.103 has the burden of providing relevant facts and documentation sufficient to establish the applicability of this exception to the information at issue. To meet this burden, the governmental body must demonstrate that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date of its receipt of the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to the pending or anticipated litigation. *See Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Both elements of the test must be met in order for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103. *See Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990).*

We note that the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information relating to litigation through discovery procedures. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. If the opposing party has seen or had access to information relating to pending or anticipated litigation, through discovery or otherwise, then there is no interest in withholding that information from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982).* In this instance, the citation is related to a pending prosecution. Thus, because the citation was provided to the defendant in the prosecution, the opposing party in the litigation has already seen that information. We therefore conclude that the citation may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

However, the citation contains motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. As noted above, section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information, which we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, none of the remaining information you have marked in the submitted citation is subject to section 552.130, and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

Finally, you seek to withhold some of the basic information, the identity of the complainant, under section 552.101 in conjunction with the informer's privilege. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Texas courts have recognized the informer's privilege. *See Aguilar v. State*, 444 S.W.2d 935, 937 (Tex. Crim. App. 1969). It protects from disclosure the identities of persons who report activities over which the governmental body has criminal or quasi-criminal law-enforcement authority, provided that the subject of the information does not already know the informer's identity. Open Records Decision Nos. 515 at 3 (1988), 208 at 1-2 (1978). The informer's privilege protects the identities of individuals who report violations of statutes to the police or similar law-enforcement agencies, as well as those who report violations of statutes with civil or criminal penalties to "administrative officials having a duty of inspection or of law enforcement within their particular spheres." Open Records Decision No. 279 at 2 (1981) (citing 8 John H. Wigmore, *Evidence in Trials at Common Law*, § 2374, at 767 (J. McNaughton rev. ed. 1961)). The report must be of a violation of a criminal or civil statute. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 582 at 2 (1990), 515 at 4-5. The privilege excepts the informer's statement only to the extent necessary to protect that informer's identity. Open Records Decision No. 549 at 5 (1990).

Here, the complainant reported a motor vehicle accident to the department. You state the complainant reported violations of a traffic control ordinance to the department. You further state the department has the authority to issue a citation for such violations, which carry a civil or criminal penalty. Therefore, we conclude that in releasing basic information, the department may withhold the complainant's identifying information, which have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with the informer's privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 156 (1977) (name of person who makes complaint about another individual to city's animal control division is excepted from disclosure by informer's privilege so long as information furnished discloses potential violation of state law).

In summary, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report form in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Except for basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit A and Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing basic information, the department may withhold the complainant's identifying information, which we marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with the informer's privilege. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code in Exhibit B and release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kathryn R. Mattingly". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the typed name and title.

Kathryn R. Mattingly
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KRM/dls

Ref: ID# 457801

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)