



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 3, 2012

Ms. Cheryl Elliott Thornton
Assistant County Attorney
Harris County
1019 Congress, 15th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2012-10267

Dear Ms. Thornton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 457787 (Harris County Attorney File No. 12PIA0207).

The Harris County Constable, Precinct 8 (the "constable") received a request for the complete personnel file for a named officer. You claim the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.102, 552.111, 552.117, and 552.1175 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form in this instance would be "for purposes other than enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude the submitted I-9 form, which we have marked, is confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, which renders tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns). Section 6103(b) defines the term “return information” as:

a taxpayer’s identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Internal Revenue Service] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]

26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term “return information” expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer’s liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Chamberlain v. Kurtz*, 589 F.2d 827, 840-41 (5th Cir. 1979); *Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff’d in part*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). Consequently, the constable must withhold the W-4 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has determined that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone

under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). The medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. ORD 598. Upon review, we find the medical record we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

Next, we note the submitted information contains L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition forms required by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Standards and Education ("TCLEOSE"), which are subject to section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.306 is also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code and provides the following:

(a) [TCLEOSE] may not issue a license to a person unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a blood test or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCLEOSE]. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a), (b). Therefore, the constable must withhold the submitted L-2 declaration forms, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCLEOSE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCLEOSE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCLEOSE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The submitted information contains an F-5 Report of Separation of Licensee. The F-5 report states the officer at issue resigned or was terminated for reasons other than substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the constable must withhold the submitted F-5 report, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement with the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes confidential CHRI, which the constable must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code. Section 560.003 provides that “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” Gov’t Code § 560.003; *see also id.* §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Therefore, the constable must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally protected by common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (common-law privacy protects assets and income source information). Further, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the constable must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwanted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). We understand you to assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test under section 552.101 of the Government Code. See *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers, Inc.*, 652 S.W.2d 546, 549-51 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the Third Court of Appeals ruled the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court expressly disagreed with *Hubert's* interpretation of section 552.102(a) and held its privacy standard differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. See *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 342 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court then considered the applicability of section 552.102, and held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. See *id.* at 346. Accordingly, the constable must withhold the birth date of a constable employee, which we have marked, under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. However, we find none of the remaining

information is excepted under section 552.102(a), and the constable may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency.” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ). We determined that section 552.111 excepts only those internal communications that consist of advice, opinions, recommendations and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *See id.*; *see also City of Garland v. The Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995).

You assert the submitted information should be protected under section 552.111. However, we note the information at issue pertains to personnel matters concerning only the named officer. You have not demonstrated how this information involves policymaking pertaining to personnel matters of a broad scope. Therefore, the constable may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 of the Government Code or section 552.1175 of the Government Code.² Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(2). Accordingly, the constable must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code provides, in part, the following:

²“Peace officer” is defined by Article 2.12 of the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure.

Information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, or social security number of [a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure], or that reveals whether the individual has family members is confidential and may not be disclosed to the public under this chapter if the individual to whom the information relates:

- (1) chooses to restrict public access to the information; and
- (2) notifies the governmental body of the individual's choice on a form provided by the governmental body, accompanied by evidence of the individual's status.

Gov't Code § 552.1175(b). Section 552.1175 also encompasses a peace officer's personal cellular telephone number if the peace officer pays for the cellular telephone service with his personal funds. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 of the Government Code not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). The submitted information contains information pertaining to peace officers not employed by the constable. Upon review, we find the constable must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 if the peace officers to whom this information concerns elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); however, the constable may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the peace officers at issue pay for the cellular telephone service with personal funds.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the constable must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the constable must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c) of

the Government Code. Accordingly, the constable must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses have affirmatively consented to their disclosure.

In summary, the constable must withhold the following: (1) the I-9 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, (2) the W-4 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, (3) the marked L-2 declaration forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, (4) the F-5 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, (5) the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code, (6) the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, (7) the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, (8) the birth dates we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, (9) the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, (10) the information we have marked under section 552.1175 if the individuals to whom this information concerns elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), including cellular telephone numbers if the peace officers at issue pay for the cellular service with personal funds, (11) the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, (12) the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code, and (13) the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.³ The medical records we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The remaining information must be released.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including a direct deposit authorization form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, a form I-9 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, a W-4 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, a fingerprint under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, an L-2 declaration under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁴We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/ag

Ref: ID# 457787

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)