



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 13, 2012

Mr. R. Kinley Hegglund, Jr.
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City of Wichita Falls
P.O. Box 1431
Wichita Falls, Texas 76307

OR2012-10888

Dear Mr. Hegglund:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 458923 (City ID# 225).

The Wichita Falls Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual, including incidents at several specified addresses during a specified time period. You claim the requested information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks all reports pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. The submitted information contains a CRB-3 Texas Peace Officer's Crash Report. In this instance, the requestor has not provided the department with two of the three pieces of required information pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4). Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted CRB-3 report, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You

state report numbers 12-040013 and 09-102135 pertain to active criminal investigations being conducted by the department. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of report number 12-040013 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report number 12-040013. However, we note report number 09-102135 relates to misdemeanor criminal mischief that occurred in 2009. The statute of limitations for misdemeanor criminal mischief is two years from the date of the offense. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.02(b) (complaint or information for Class C misdemeanor theft may be presented within two years from date of commission of the offense, and not afterward); Penal Code § 28.03(b)(1)(A) (criminal mischief is a Class C misdemeanor if the amount of pecuniary loss is less than \$50). More than two years have elapsed since the events giving rise to the investigation in report number 09-102135, and you have not informed this office any criminal charges were filed within the limitations period. Further, you have not otherwise demonstrated how release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Therefore, we find you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) to report number 09-102135, and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report number 12-040013 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We note some of the information in report number 09-102135 is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the marked CRB-3 report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report number 12-040013 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in report number 09-102135 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure for the remaining submitted information, it must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 458923

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).