



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 19, 2012

Ms. Sharon Alexander
Associate General Counsel
Texas Department of Transportation
125 East 11th Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2012-11211

Dear Ms. Alexander:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 459642.

The Texas Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for letters of interest received from the top ranked firms in response to solicitation numbers 31-1RFP5001 and 31-1RFP5003. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.104 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of several third parties. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the third parties of the request for information and of their rights to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released.¹ See Gov't Code § 552.305(d); see also Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received correspondence from AIA and Brown. We have reviewed the submitted arguments and the submitted information.

¹The third parties notified were AIA Engineers, Ltd. ("AIA"); AMD Engineering, L.L.C.; Atkins; Brown & Gay Engineers, Inc. ("Brown"); CP&Y, Inc.; HDR Engineering, Inc.; HNTB Corporation; Huitt-Zollars, Inc.; Infrastructure Associates, Inc.; Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc.; and Lockwood Andrews & Newnam, Inc.

Section 552.104 of the Government Code excepts from required public disclosure “information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder.” Gov’t Code § 552.104. The purpose of section 552.104 is to protect the purchasing interests of a governmental body in competitive bidding situations where the governmental body wishes to withhold information in order to obtain more favorable offers. *See* Open Records Decision No. 592 (1991) (discussing statutory predecessor). Section 552.104 protects information from disclosure if the governmental body demonstrates potential harm to its interests in a particular competitive situation. *See* Open Records Decision No. 463 (1987). Generally, section 552.104 does not except information from disclosure after bidding is completed and the contract has been executed. *See* Open Records Decision No. 541 (1990). However, in Open Records Decision No. 541, this office stated the predecessor to section 552.104 may protect information after bidding is complete if the governmental body demonstrates public disclosure of the information will allow competitors to undercut future bids, and the governmental body solicits bids for the same or similar goods or services on a recurring basis. *See id.* at 5 (recognizing limited situation in which statutory predecessor to section 552.104 continued to protect information submitted by successful bidder when disclosure would allow competitors to accurately estimate and undercut future bids); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 309 (suggesting that such principle will apply when governmental body solicits bids for same or similar goods or services on recurring basis).

In this instance, you argue the disclosure of the submitted information “would harm [the department]’s competitive interests pertaining to the bidding process used in awarding contracts[.]” You inform us “[d]isclosure of this information would undermine the quality of proposals and undermining [sic] competition among bidders.” You state the department “solicits bids for professional services, including the same types of services at issue here, on a recurring basis.” You assert the release of the information at issue “will undercut [the department’s] negotiating position with respect to future procurements for such contracts.” Based on your representations, we find you have demonstrated public release of the submitted information would cause specific harm to the department’s interests in particular competitive situations. Therefore, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.104 of the Government Code. As we make this determination, we do not address the remaining arguments.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 459642

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Sandeep Patil
Vice President
AIA Engineers, Ltd.
15310 Park Row
Houston, Texas 77084
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Lori J. Davidson
AMD Engineering, L.L.C.
411 Commerce Street
Childress, Texas 79201
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Robin Handel
CP&Y, Inc.
1820 Regal Row
Dallas, Texas 75235
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. George Tillett
HDR Engineering, Inc.
4401 Westgate Boulevard, Suite 400
Austin, Texas 78745
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Charles Quade
Huit-Zollars, Inc.
Suite 1400
1717 McKinney Avenue
Dallas, Texas 75202
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Nancy Mitchell
Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.
Suite 1400
8350 North Central Expressway
Dallas, Texas 75206
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. William D. Dillon
Executive Vice President
Brown & Gay Engineers, Inc.
2595 Dallas Parkway, Suite 204
Frisco, Texas 75034
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Brad White
Project Manager
Infrastructure Associates, Inc.
Suite 200
6117 Richmond Avenue
Houston, Texas 77057
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. David L. Justice
Senior Project Manager
Jacobs Engineering, Inc.
7950 Elmbrook Drive
Dallas, Texas 75247
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael W. Ebeling
Project Manager
HNTB Corporation
5310 West Plano Parkway, Suite 200
Plano, Texas 75093
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Robert J. Hundley
Assoc. Vice President, Program Controls
Atkins
Suite 200
6504 Bridge Point Parkway
Austin, Texas 78730
(w/o enclosures)