



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 19, 2012

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-11212

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 459256 (DPD Request No. 2012-04942).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all e-mails sent or received by a named officer during a certain period of time.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Initially, we note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. Section 552.301 prescribes procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to determine whether requested information is

¹As you have not submitted a copy of the request for information, we take our description from your brief.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a). Section 552.301(b) requires a governmental body to ask for the attorney general's decision and claim its exceptions to disclosure not later than the tenth business day after the date of its receipt of the written request for information. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body that receives a request for information it wishes to withhold under the Act is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e).

In this instance, you inform us the department received the instant request for information on April 26, 2012; therefore, the department's ten- and fifteen-business-day periods under subsections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e) were May 10, 2012, and May 17, 2012, respectively. However, the envelope in which you requested a ruling from this office bears a meter mark of May 11, 2012. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail). Further, you have not submitted a copy of the written request for information. Accordingly, we find the department has failed to comply with the requirements of sections 552.301(b) and (e) of the Government Code in seeking a ruling from this office.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302 (where request for attorney general decision does not comply with requirements of section 552.301, information at issue is presumed to be public); *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977).

Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived; as such, this section does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of

the submitted information under section 552.108. However, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address the applicability of this exception to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You represent that the information you have marked under section 261.201 constitutes records used or developed in investigations of alleged child abuse. Upon review, we agree the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, pertains to investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse and is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining "abuse" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201 as "person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes"). As you do not indicate that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Accordingly, the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).* The department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are

confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007, “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2)(A). The information you have marked involves a sixteen-year-old runaway. Thus, this information involves a child engaged in conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997, and is subject to section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(b) (defining “conduct indicating a need for supervision” to include “the voluntary absence of a child from the child’s home without the consent of the child’s parent or guardian for a substantial length of time or without intent to return”). Accordingly, the marked information is confidential pursuant to section 58.007 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82.

The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records*

Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). We agree the information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not a matter of legitimate public interest. We therefore conclude the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The information you have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 58.007 of the Family Code and (2) common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 459256

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)