



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 20, 2012

Mr. R. Kinley Hegglund, Jr.
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City of Wichita Falls
P.O. Box 1431
Wichita Falls, Texas 76307

OR2012-11305

Dear Mr. Hegglund:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 459524 (City ID# 236).

The Wichita Falls Police Department (the "department") received a request for information from a specified date pertaining to a named deceased individual. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.119 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information consists of a completed investigation that is subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(1) provides for the required public disclosure of "a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body[,]" unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 (1999) (governmental body may waive section 552.103). As such, section 552.103 does not make information confidential for the

purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, we will address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. You also claim sections 552.101 and 552.119 of the Government Code. Because these sections can make information confidential under the Act, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. We understand the City of Wichita Falls is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files: a police officer’s civil service file that the civil service director is required to maintain, and an internal file that the police department may maintain for its own use. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). The police officer’s civil service file must contain specific items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the officer’s supervisor, and documents from the employing department relating to any misconduct in which the department took disciplinary action against the officer under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code.¹ *See id.* § 143.089(a)(1)-(2). In cases in which a police department investigates an officer’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer’s misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records are subject to release under chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, a document relating to an officer’s alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service personnel file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(b). Information that reasonably relates to a police officer’s employment relationship with the police department and that is maintained in a police department’s internal personnel file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 851 S.W.2d 946 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

¹Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *See* Local Gov’t Code §§ 143.051-.055.

You state the submitted information is maintained in the department's files under section 143.089(g). You state the submitted information relates to investigations that have not resulted in disciplinary action under chapter 143. We note, however, the submitted information consists of law enforcement records, which are also maintained separate and apart from the internal affairs investigations. The present request does not specifically seek information from an officer's personnel file maintained by the department. Instead, the requestor seeks information related to the incident at issue. Because the requestor generally seeks information pertaining to the specified incident, both information in an officer's personnel file and any copies of investigatory materials the department maintains for law enforcement purposes are responsive. The department may not engraft the confidentiality afforded to records under section 143.089(g) to records that exist independently of the internal files. Accordingly, we find the submitted information is not confidential under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Next, we note the submitted information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides the attorney general shall make the custodial death report available to any interested person, with the exception of any portion of the report that the attorney general determines is privileged. *See* Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.18(b). The report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The Office of the Attorney General has determined the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18(b). Although you claim the submitted custodial death report and summary are protected by section 552.108 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). The department must release this information, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the remaining information pertains to a closed criminal investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that the department has demonstrated that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd*

n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See also Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must release the custodial death report pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/som

Ref: ID# 459524

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against disclosure.