



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 23, 2012

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2012-11409

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 459575 (Fort Worth PIR# W016746).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for a specified incident report. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part the following:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(1)-(l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed by the city's police department in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (defining "abuse" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code as including offense of aggravated sexual assault under section 22.021 of the Penal Code); *see also* Penal Code § 22.021 (defining "child" for purposes of Penal Code section 22.021 as a person under 17 years of age). Therefore, we find the submitted information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, the requestor is one of the child victims listed in the submitted information, and is now an adult. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(1) states any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness who is under 18 years

of age and is not a child of the parent shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(1). Further, section 261.201(1)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information about an individual if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82.

The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded that, generally, only that information which either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No 393 at 2 (1983); *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld).

We note the requestor is one of the alleged victims in this case. However, we also note the requestor knows the identity of the other alleged victim. We believe that, in this instance, withholding only identifying information of the other victim from the requestor would not preserve the common-law right to privacy of the other victim. We further note the requestor generally would have a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to information that is excepted from public disclosure under laws intended to protect her privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. However, the requestor does not have a special right of access to information that implicates the other victim's privacy interests. Thus, the requestor's right to information under section 552.023 does not overcome another victim's privacy right in the same information. We conclude, therefore, that the city must withhold the submitted information in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining claim.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Vanessa Burgess', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Vanessa Burgess
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

VB/dls

Ref: ID# 459575

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)