



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 14, 2012

Ms. Zeena Angadicheril
Office of General Counsel
The University of Texas System
201 West Seventh Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2902

OR2012-12778

Dear Ms. Angadicheril:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 462458 (OGC# 144221).

The University of Texas at Austin (the "university") received a request for eight categories of information pertaining to the Texas Materials Institute during a specified time period.¹ You state some of the requested information does not exist.² You state the university will release some of the requested information to the requestor with redactions pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the

¹You indicate the university received clarification of the request from the requestor's colleague. See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purpose of clarifying or narrowing request for information); *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 384 (Tex. 2010) (when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of unclear or over-broad request for public information, ten-day period to request attorney general ruling is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

²The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. See *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

United States Code.³ You also state the university will redact access device information pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code and e-mail addresses subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code in accordance with Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).⁴ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.⁵ We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released.)

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 51.914 of the Education Code, which provides, in pertinent part:

(a) In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being

³The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. The DOE has determined FERPA determinations must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education records. We have posted a copy of the letter from the DOE to this office on the Attorney General's website: <http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

⁴Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code permits a governmental body to redact an access device number subject to section 552.136(b) without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.136(c); *see also id.* § 552.136(d)-(e) (requestor may appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information under section 552.136(c) to attorney general and governmental body withholding information pursuant to section 552.136(c) must provide certain notice to requestor). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁵We assume the "representative sample" of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee; [or]

(2) any information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such product, device, or process, and any technological and scientific information (including computer programs) that is the proprietary information of a person, partnership, corporation, or federal agency that has been disclosed to an institution of higher education solely for the purposes of a written research contract or grant that contains a provision prohibiting the institution of higher education from disclosing such proprietary information to third persons or parties[.]

...

(b) Information maintained by or for an institution of higher education that would reveal the institution's plans or negotiations for commercialization or a proposed research agreement, contract, or grant, or that consists of unpublished research or data that may be commercialized, is not subject to [the Act], unless the information has been published, is patented, or is otherwise subject to an executed license, sponsored research agreement, or research contract or grant. In this subsection, "institution of higher education" has the meaning assigned by Section 61.003 [of the Education Code].

Educ. Code § 51.914(a)(1)-(2), (b). As noted in Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997), the legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular scientific information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee." Open Records Decision No. 651 at 9-10. Furthermore, whether particular scientific information has such a potential is a question of fact that this office is unable to resolve in the opinion process. *See id.* at 10. Thus, this office has stated that in considering whether requested information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee," we will rely on a governmental body's assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.* However, a governmental body's determination that information has a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee is subject to judicial review. *See id.* We note that section 51.914 is not applicable to working titles of experiments or other information that does not reveal the details of the research. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 557 at 3 (1990), 497 at 6-7 (1988).

You seek to withhold the information at issue under section 51.914 of the Education Code. You state the information at issue contains the details of research, the findings of the research projects at issue, research protocols, scientific information and procedures, and other information that is related to a product, device, or process, or application of same, developed by university employees. You assert this information has the potential for being further sold,

traded, or licensed for a fee and is therefore confidential pursuant to section 51.914(a). Further, you state the information at issue reveals data that is not yet published and may be or has been commercialized. You assert this information is excepted pursuant to section 51.914(b). Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the university must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code. However, we find the university has failed to explain how the remaining information at issue, which consists of e-mails, falls within the scope of section 51.914. Accordingly, the university may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code.

We note the remaining information contains information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code.⁶ Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 of the Government Code not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, a governmental body must withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of current or former employees only if these individuals made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Accordingly, if the employees whose information is at issue timely elected to keep their information confidential pursuant to section 552.024 and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the university must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1). The university may not withhold this information under section 552.117 if the employees did not timely elect to keep their information confidential or if the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body.

In summary, the university must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code. If the employees whose information is at issue timely elected to keep their information confidential pursuant to section 552.024 and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the university must withhold the information we have

⁶The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The university may not withhold this information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code if the employees did not timely elect to keep their information confidential or if the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sean Opperman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SO/som

Ref: ID# 462458

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)