



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 4, 2012

Ms. M. Ann Montgomery-Moran
Assistant Ellis County and District Attorney
109 South Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2012-13922

Dear Ms. Montgomery-Moran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 463883.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual for a specified time period and information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681–82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouses files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to

the public. We note the present request requires the sheriff's office to, in part, compile unspecified criminal history records concerning the individual named in the request, and thus, implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We further note that you have submitted information that does not depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant and information pertaining to the specified incident. Thus, this information is not part of the named individual's criminal history compilation and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note some of the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of child endangerment. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Upon review, we find this information falls within the scope of section 261.201(a). You have not indicated that the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the information at issue, which we have marked, is confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, and the sheriff's office must withhold it in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing predecessor statute).*¹

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. See Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. See *id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the remaining information pertains to concluded criminal investigations that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on these representations, we find section 552.108(a)(2) is generally applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) and includes a detailed description of the offense and the identity of the complainant. See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information does not include motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sean Nottingham".

Sean Nottingham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SN/bhf

Ref: ID# 463883

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)