



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 5, 2012

Mr. Stanton Strickland
Associate Commissioner
Legal Section
General Counsel Division
Texas Department of Insurance
P.O. Box 149104 - Mail Code 110-1A
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2012-14023

Dear Mr. Strickland:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 464371 (TDI # 128812).

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for nine categories of information regarding the department and three specified insurance companies, from the year 2010 to the present.¹ You state some of the requested information will be released to the requestor. Although you take no position on the public availability of the submitted information, you state the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of third parties. Accordingly, you inform us you notified American Republic Insurance Company and World Insurance Company (collectively, "American") of the request and of the company's right to submit comments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released to the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305

¹We note the department sought and received clarification from the requestor regarding the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (stating if information requested is unclear to governmental body or if large amount of information has been requested, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify or narrow request, but may not inquire into purpose for which information will be used); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure under the Act in certain circumstances). We have received correspondence from an attorney representing American. We have reviewed the submitted information.

We note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from American on why the company's submitted information should not be released.² Therefore, we have no basis to conclude American has protected proprietary interests in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest American may have in it.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the owner of the e-mail address consents to its release or the e-mail address falls within the scope of section 552.137(c).³ *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 is not applicable to the work e-mail address of an employee of a governmental body because such an address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public" but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The department must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.⁴ As no further exceptions to disclosure were raised, the remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²We note American provided no arguments objecting to the release of its information in its July 19, 2012, correspondence to this office.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

⁴We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kathryn R. Mattingly
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KRM/bhf

Ref: ID# 464371

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael E. Abbott
President
American Republic Insurance Company
World Insurance Company
P.O. Box 14556
Des Moines, Iowa 50306
(w/o enclosures)