



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

September 12, 2012

Ms. Delietrice Henry  
Open Records Assistant  
Plano Police Department  
P.O. Box 860358  
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2012-14461

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 465124 (Plano PIR # DRUR61912).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records related to a named individual for a specified time period. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) it contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We agree the present request requires the department to compile unspecified criminal history records concerning the individual named in the request, and thus, implicates her privacy interests. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal

defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of the individual's criminal history under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Therefore, we will consider your remaining arguments against the disclosure of this information.

We note some of the information at issue is protected by common-law privacy. The doctrine of common-law privacy is subject to the two pronged test discussed above. Common-law privacy also encompasses the specific types of information held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*, which included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has also found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (information pertaining to prescription drugs, specific illnesses, operations and procedures, and physical disabilities protected from disclosure). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold this marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We find the remaining information at issue is not highly embarrassing or intimate information with no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, no portion of the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.<sup>1</sup> See Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). We find the department must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Burgess  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

VB/dls

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>2</sup>We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Ref: ID# 465124

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)