ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 26, 2012

Mr. Nathan L. Brown
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2012-15344

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 466065.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

> (c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

> (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
>
> (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
>
> (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.
>
> . . .
>
> (e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.
>
> . . .
>
> (j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:
>
> . . .
>
> (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). Therefore, the submitted information is within the scope of section 58.007(c). However, the requestor is the step-parent of the juvenile suspect listed in the report and may have a right of access to information otherwise made confidential by section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 58.007(e) (law enforcement records may be inspected by child's parent or guardian). As we are unable to determine whether the requestor is a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect, we must rule conditionally. If the department determines the requestor is not a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect, the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor is a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect, the department may not withhold the submitted information from the requestor on the basis of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides before a parent or guardian of

a juvenile suspect may inspect the information, the department must withhold information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

> (a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:
>
> > (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
> >
> > (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.
>
> . . .
>
> (k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.
>
> (l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:
>
> > . . .
> >
> > (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and
> >
> > (3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Id. § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2)-(3). You state the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001 (defining "abuse" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Based on your representations and our review, we find the submitted information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code.

In this instance, the requestor is a step-parent of the child victim listed in the submitted information and is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse at issue. As such, this requestor may have a right of access to the submitted information pursuant to section 261.201(k). *Id.* § 261.201(k). Thus, if the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the listed child victim, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the listed child victim, then the department may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold this report from the requestor. *Id.* However, section 261.201(l)(3) states the identity of the reporting party must be withheld. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(3). Further, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). You raise section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code as an exception to disclosure. Therefore, we will address the applicability of section 552.108 to the submitted report.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the submitted information relates to a concluded case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representations, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the submitted information.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, if the requestor is a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect and a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim, then, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, as previously noted, section 261.201(l)(3) of the Family Code states the identity of the

reporting party must be withheld. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(l)(3). Thus, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(3) of the Family Code.

In summary, if the department determines the requestor is not a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect, the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 in of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor is a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect, but is not a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect and a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim, then, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(3) of the Family Code.[1]

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Luttrall

Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/som

[1]In this instance, because the requestor has a right of access to certain information that otherwise would be excepted from release under the Act, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor.

Ref: ID# 466065

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)