



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 9, 2012

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2012-15982

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 468490 (Fort Worth Public Information Request No. W019042).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving a named individual. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. You assert the submitted information is subject to this section. However, we note section 58.007 is inapplicable in this instance because the conduct at issue occurred in 1994. Accordingly, we will address your argument under former section 51.14 of the Family Code.

Prior to its repeal by the Seventy-fourth Legislature, section 51.14(d) of the Family Code provided for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records pertaining to conduct occurring before January 1, 1996. Former section 51.14(d) was continued in effect for that

purpose. *See* Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, § 100, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517, 2591. Former section 51.14 provided, in relevant part:

(d) Except as provided by Article 15.27, Code of Criminal Procedure, and except for files and records relating to a charge for which a child is transferred under Section 54.02 of this code to a criminal court for prosecution, the law-enforcement files and records are not open to public inspection nor may their contents be disclosed to the public, but inspection of the files and records is permitted by:

- (1) a juvenile court having the child before it in any proceeding;
- (2) an attorney for a party to the proceeding; and
- (3) law-enforcement officers when necessary for the discharge of their official duties.

Fam. Code § 51.14 (repealed 1995). A “child” is defined as a person who was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted report pertains to an incident that occurred prior to January 1, 1996, and lists as suspects two individuals who were ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the offense. Further, the requestor does not fall within one of the categories in former section 51.14(d) under which inspection of the records would be permitted. Accordingly, the submitted information is confidential under former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code.

In this instance, however, the requestor is a special agent with United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement (“ICE”) and may have a right of access to some of the submitted information. We note section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information [“CHRI”] maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See* Gov’t Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] [CHRI] maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information contains CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, if the requestor represents a “criminal justice agency,” she is authorized to obtain CHRI from the city pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b).

A “criminal justice agency” is defined in part as “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines “administration of criminal justice” as “the performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender.” The term includes “criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of criminal history record information.” *Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).*

As previously noted, the requestor is a special agent with ICE. Although it appears the requestor is engaged in the administration of criminal justice, we cannot determine whether she intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, if the city determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, section 411.087(a)(2) does not apply and the city must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 51.14 of the Family Code. If the city determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2), the city must generally make available to the requestor information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. The city must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code. In that instance, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code and the requestor’s right of access under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See Gov’t Code* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim.

App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, although former section 51.14(d) generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code gives specific types of requestors, criminal justice agencies, access to particular information, CHRI, for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code. Therefore, notwithstanding former section 51.14(d), if the city determines this requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then the city must release to this requestor information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/som

Ref: ID# 468490

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)