



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 9, 2012

Ms. Evelyn Njuguna
Houston Police Department Staff Attorney
City of Houston
1200 Travis
Houston, Texas 77002-6000

OR2012-16054

Dear Ms. Njuguna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 467302 (OR No. 12-4421).

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . information concerning a deceased natural person, including a stillborn infant or fetus, that would be identifying information of that person were that person alive, if the item of information is obtained, possessed, transferred, or used without legal authorization[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(2). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides as follows:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, the submitted report pertains to a forgery investigation, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. Additionally, the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. We note the requestor may be the authorized representative of the victim's estate. If the requestor is acting as the identity theft victim's authorized representative, then the information is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the submitted report may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code if the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the victim's estate. However, we note the information at issue contains information subject to sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code, which make information confidential for the purposes of article 2.29.¹

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (9187), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual’s criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license or driver’s license issued by an agency of this state, or another state or country, is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In the event the requestor is not the authorized representative of the identity theft victim’s estate, we address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *Id.* § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested).

You state the submitted information relates to a closed investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information

refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.— Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the identity theft victim's estate, then the department must release the submitted information to the requestor pursuant to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure but must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and under section 552.130 of the Government Code.² However, if the requestor is not the authorized representative of the identity theft victim's estate, then with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/tch

²We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Ref: ID# 467302

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)