



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 22, 2012

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-16826

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 472758 (PIR# 2012-11568).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to service report number 154076-Z. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

You argue portions of the submitted information are excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You have marked the information the department seeks to withhold under section 552.108. You state the marked information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we find release of the marked information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, the department may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

Next, you argue some of the remaining information is protected by section 552.101 of the Government Code, which excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82.

The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We note dates of birth of members of the public are generally not highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455 at 7 (1987)* (home addresses, telephone numbers, dates of birth not protected under privacy). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how the marked information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department may not withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked in the remaining records under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

²As we make this determination, we do not address your remaining claims for this information.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.³ The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 472758

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination authorizing all governmental bodies to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.