



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 23, 2012

Ms. Claire Yancey
Assistant District Attorney
Denton County Criminal District Attorney's Office
P.O. Box 2850
Denton, Texas 76202

OR2012-16873

Dear Ms. Yancey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 468615.

The Denton County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for all records regarding two specified cause numbers.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We must address the district attorney's office's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to

¹Since you did not submit the requestor's written request for information, we take our description from the district attorney's office's brief.

indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. See Gov't Code § 552.301(e). You inform us the district attorney's office received the request on August 2, 2012. Accordingly, the district attorney's office's fifteen-business-day deadline was August 23, 2012. However, as of the date of this letter, you have not submitted for our review the request for information. Consequently, we find the district attorney's office failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. See *id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-81 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because the district attorney's office has failed to comply with the requirements of the Act, the district attorney's office has waived its arguments under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, which are discretionary exceptions that do not make information confidential under the Act. See Gov't Code § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure under section 552.302, we address the applicability of those exceptions to the submitted information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. See 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); see generally Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement with the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of confidential CHRI and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code provides, “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional are confidential.” Health & Safety Code § 611.002; *see also id.* § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *See id.* § 611.001(2). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals, including “a person who has the written consent of the patient, or a parent if the patient is a minor [.]” *See id.* §§ 611.004(a)(4), .0045; ORD 565. We have marked mental health records that are confidential under section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code and may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-167.002. Section 159.002 provides in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has determined that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have also found when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). The medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. ORD 598. Upon review, we find the medical records we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered highly intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). This office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See generally* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary

investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). This office has also found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See Gov't Code § 441.081(b)* (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes information that is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Gov't Code § 552.130*. Upon review, we find the district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Therefore, the district attorney's office may withhold the social security numbers in the submitted information under section 552.147(a) of the Government Code.³

In summary, the mental health records we have marked may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. The medical records we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The district attorney's office must withhold (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code, (2) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, and (3) the motor vehicle information we have

³We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Gov't Code § 552.147(b)*.

marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office may withhold social security numbers in the submitted information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kathryn R. Mattingly
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KRM/dls

Ref: ID# 468615

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)