



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 23, 2012

Mr. Nathan L. Brown
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2012-16908

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 470058.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for offense reports pertaining to a named individual's arrest for DWI on a specified date and the same individual's arrest for aggravated assault on another specified date. We understand you have marked social security numbers for redaction pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

(Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You claim the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual and thus implicates this individual's right to privacy. However, the requestor seeks two specific reports pertaining to the named individual's arrests on specified dates involving specified offenses. Thus, we find this request does not implicate the privacy interest of a named individual, and the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert the submitted information relates to cases that concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

We note, however, the requestor is an investigator with the Texas Board of Nursing (the "board"). Section 411.125 of the Government Code provides:

The [board] is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to a person who:

(1) is an applicant for or holder of a license issued by the board;

(2) has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board; or

(3) is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge against the person.

Gov't Code § 411.125. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) A person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). "Criminal history record information" is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, under sections 411.125 and 411.087, the requestor may have a right of access to any criminal history record information about the named individual contained in the department's records. The submitted police reports list the named individual as an arrested person. Thus, the reports may contain criminal history record information about this individual.

Accordingly, if the individual at issue is an applicant for a license from the board, a holder of a license from the board, has requested a determination of eligibility for a license from the board, or is subject to investigation by the board in connection with a complaint or formal charge, then the requestor is authorized to obtain the criminal history record information in the submitted reports from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .082(2), .125(a). Although you also raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for such information, a specific statutory right of access overcomes the general exceptions in the Act, such as section 552.108. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act).* Thus, if any of these conditions is met, then

the department must make available to the requestor criminal history record information under section 411.087. In that instance, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. However, if the individual who is named as the arrested person in the report does not meet any of the criteria of subsection 411.125(1)-(3), then the board does not have a special right of access to the criminal history record information under section 411.087. In that event, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the board has a right of access pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, the department must make available to the requestor criminal history record information regarding the named individual under section 411.087 but may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code, with the exception of basic information. If the board does not have a right of access to the criminal history record information under section 411.087 then, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACV/ag

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument under section 552.130 of the Government Code for portions of the submitted information.

Ref: ID# 470058

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)