



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 24, 2012

Mr. Nathan L. Brown
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, Ninth Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2012-16998

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 468739.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to 9-1-1 calls made by or for two named individuals, including specified calls, during a specified period of time. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have redacted the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers in the submitted event reports. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708 (2003), this office issued a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Therefore, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You assert the requests implicate one of the named individual's right to privacy because the requestor is seeking the individual's criminal history records. The request for information pertaining to the specified calls does not require the department to compile unspecified records; thus, the specified calls do not implicate this individual's right to privacy. We also note the remaining information does not list the individual at issue as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, the remaining information also does not implicate the privacy interests of the individual at issue. Accordingly, we conclude the department may not withhold any of the submitted information as a compilation of criminal history under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report number 12-193006 relates to a pending criminal investigation and/or prosecution. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the information pertaining to report number 12-193006 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. Department of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to information pertaining to report number 12-193006.

Next, you claim the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2)*. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must

demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information relates to cases that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation and our review of the information at issue, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note the submitted information includes event reports. In Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996), this office concluded information contained in a computer-assisted dispatch (“CAD”) report is substantially the same as basic information. *See* ORD 649 at 3; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 394 at 3 (1983) (there is no qualitative difference between information contained in radio cards or radio logs and front-page offense report information expressly held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*; thus, such information is generally public). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold information pertaining to report number 12-193006 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/tch

Ref: ID# 468739

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)