



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 6, 2012

Ms. Michele Tapia  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Carrollton  
1945 East Jackson Road  
Carrollton, Texas 75006

OR2012-17776

Dear Ms. Tapia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 470190.

The City of Carrollton (the "city") received a request for a specified report. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we agree the submitted report was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* 261.001(1)(E) (definition of child abuse includes indecency with a child under Penal Code section 21.11); *see also* Penal Code § 21.11(a) (defining “child” for purposes of Penal Code section 21.11 as a person younger than 17 years of age). Accordingly, we find the submitted report is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. We note, however, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the report, and he is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. In this instance, the city may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold this report from this requestor. Fam. Code § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). You raise sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, will address the applicability of these sections to the submitted report.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

*Id.* § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). We note section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party. You state the submitted information involves a child engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. However, upon our review, we find the submitted information does not identify a suspect or offender who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. As such, section 58.007 is not applicable, and the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 on this basis.

You also raise common-law privacy for the submitted report. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. However, in this instance, the requestor is the parent of the child whose privacy rights are implicated. Pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, “[a] person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the

general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023(a)-(b). Thus, the requestor has a right of access to his child's private information pursuant to section 552.023, and the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is generally applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the submitted information from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php),

---

<sup>1</sup>As we are able to resolve this issue under section 552.108, we do not address your remaining claim against disclosure of the submitted information, except to note basic information may not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Because the requestor has a right of access to certain information that otherwise would be excepted from release under the Act, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor.

or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jennifer Luttrall", written over a horizontal line.

Jennifer Luttrall  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JL/som

Ref: ID# 470190

---

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)