



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 14, 2012

Ms. M. Ann Montgomery-Moran
Assistant Ellis County and District Attorney
County of Ellis
109 South Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2012-18373

Dear Ms. Montgomery-Moran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 471058.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to an incident that occurred at a specified date and time at a specified address. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information we have marked was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect; thus, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As you do not indicate the investigating agency adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we determine the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute)*. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold this information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. None of the remaining information pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261; thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue relates to a criminal case that is pending investigation and prosecution. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559

(Tex. 1976). Thus, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find that the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.²

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We find the sheriff's office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147.³

In summary, the sheriff's office: (1) must withhold the information we have marked in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code; (2) may withhold the information you have marked under

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy for this information.

³We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; (3) must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (4) must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (5) may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/tch

Ref: ID# 471058

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)