



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 26, 2012

Mr. Bill Delmore
Assistant District Attorney
9th Judicial District
Montgomery County
207 West Phillips, 2nd Floor
Conroe, Texas 77301

OR2012-18893

Dear Mr. Delmore:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 471779.

The 9th Judicial District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for a specified supplemental report, specified audio recordings, and documents listing a specified date as the date of the offense at issue in case number 11-3990. You state the district attorney's office does not maintain information responsive to the request for the specified supplemental report or specified audio recordings.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. See Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

¹We note the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Attorney General Opinion H-90 (1973); Open Records Decision Nos. 452 at 2-3 (1986), 342 at 3 (1982), 87 (1975); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 572 at 1 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 416 at 5 (1984).

Initially, we note portions of the submitted information, which we have marked, are not responsive to the instant request because they do not list the specified date as the date of the offense at issue in case number 11-3990. The district attorney's office need not release nonresponsive information in response to this request, and this ruling will not address that information.

Next, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of a completed investigation that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The district attorney's office must release the completed investigation pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(1). You seek to withhold the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1) under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, section 552.111 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 677 (2002) (governmental body may waive attorney work product privilege under section 552.111), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions).* Therefore, the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1) may not be withheld under section 552.111 of the Government Code. We note the attorney work product privilege is found at rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, which has been held to be "other law" for purposes of section 552.022(a). *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). However, the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure apply only to "actions of a civil nature." *See TEX. R. CIV. P. 2.* Thus, because the responsive information relates to a criminal case, the attorney work product privilege found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure does not apply in this instance and the information may not be withheld on that basis. However, will consider your arguments under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal

investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the responsive information relates to a concluded case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the responsive information.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the responsive information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Luttrall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JL/som

²We note the basic information includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147.

Ref: ID# 471779

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)