



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 28, 2012

Ms. L. Carolyn Nivens
Paralegal
Ross, Banks, May, Cron & Cavin, PC
2 Riverway, Suite 700
Houston, Texas 77056

OR2012-19094

Dear Ms. Nivens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 472494 (City Ref. No. 2258, Ross Banks File No. 3607-1).

The League City Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for report numbers 12-4289, 12-4045, and 12-3374. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. You contend the submitted information is confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c), which provides as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” is defined as a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *Id.* § 51.02(2)(A). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party; it is only applicable to juveniles listed as suspects or offenders. *See id.* §§ 58.007, 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007). We have reviewed the submitted information and find it does not identify a juvenile suspect or offender for purposes of section 58.007. Accordingly, we find that you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Thus, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. You assert the submitted information is confidential in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note because privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates to only a deceased individual. Accordingly, information pertaining solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). We note portions of the submitted information

pertain to a deceased individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy based on the privacy interests of the deceased individual. Furthermore, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any other portion of the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report number 12-4045 relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Additionally, you state report number 12-4289 relates to an ongoing criminal investigation. Based upon these representations, we find release of report numbers 12-4045 and 12-4289 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is generally applicable to report numbers 12-4045 and 12-4289.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You state report number 12-3374 relates to an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to report number 12-3374.

However, section 552.108 does not except basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Thus, with the exception of basic

information, which must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 12-4045 and 12-4289 under section 552.108(a)(1) and report 12-3374 under section 552.108(a)(2).¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Burgess
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

VB/dls

Ref: ID# 472494

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.