



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 7, 2012

Mr. Warren M. S. Ernst
Chief of the General Counsel Division
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street, Room 7BN
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2012-19777

Dear Mr. Ernst:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 473207.

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for all e-mails containing five specified terms sent or received by a named individual since a specified date. You state some information will be provided to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.116 and 552.139 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request because it does not consist of an e-mail. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the city is not required to release non-responsive information in response to the request.²

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.116 provides as follows:

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, a hospital district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from [required public disclosure]. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from [public disclosure] by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) "Audit" means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, the bylaws adopted by or other action of the governing board of a hospital district, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) "Audit working paper" includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the information contained in Exhibit C consists of a draft audit report and audit working papers of the city's Audit of Controls Over Leased Equipment. You inform us the audit was conducted pursuant to Chapter IX, Section 3 of the city charter. Based on your representations and our review, we agree the information contained in Exhibit C constitutes audit working papers under section 552.116. Thus, the city may withhold the remaining responsive information under section 552.116 of the Government Code.³

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kathleen J. Santos
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KJS/dls

Ref: ID# 473207

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)