



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 10, 2012

Ms. Samantha Dyal  
For City of Schertz  
Fulbright & Jaworski, L.L.P.  
300 Convent Street, Suite 2100  
San Antonio, Texas 78205

OR2012-19826

Dear Ms. Dyal:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 473392.

The Schertz Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all recordings from a specified traffic accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe

emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). In addition, this office also has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-12 (1992) (identifying public and private portions of certain state personnel records), 545 at 4 (1990) (“In general, we have found the kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to be those regarding the receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities”), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common-law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public’s interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis). Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated that the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual’s privacy.

In this instance, although you seek to withhold the submitted information in its entirety, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation where the submitted information must be withheld in its entirety on the basis of common-law privacy. Upon review, however, we find portions of the submitted information to be highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy, which consists of two inter-related types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5, 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7. The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy,” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected by constitutional privacy is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated that any of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or otherwise implicates an

individual's privacy interest for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Therefore, the department must withhold the portions of the submitted recordings that depict discernible license plate numbers or driver's license numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the portions of the submitted recordings that depict discernible license plate numbers or driver's license numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle R. Garza  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MRG/som

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470.

Ref: ID# 473392

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)