



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 18, 2012

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-20331

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 478478 (PIR# 2012-14279).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to service number 258652-z. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(b)*. You state the department received the request for information on November 13, 2012. You inform this office that the

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988)*. This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

department was closed on November 22, 2012 and November 23, 2012. Accordingly, the department's ten-business-day deadline was November 29, 2012. However, you did not submit your request for a decision until November 30, 2012. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

A governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the waiver of its claims under the exceptions at issue, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977).

You claim an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is a discretionary exception that may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 52.108 subject to waiver). However, the interests under section 552.108 of a governmental body other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") asserts a law enforcement interest in the information at issue. Therefore, we will determine whether the department may withhold the submitted information on behalf of the district attorney's office under section 552.108. Further, your remaining claim under section 552.130 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure. Accordingly, we will address these claims for the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state the information you have marked relates to a pending criminal prosecution and that the district attorney's office objects to its release at this time because release of the information at issue would interfere with the prosecution of the case. Based on the objections made by the district attorney's office and our review, we find the release of the

information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987) (section 552.108 may be invoked by any proper custodian of information relating to pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct). Therefore, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in the submitted documents under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

To conclude, the department may withhold the marked information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 478478

Enc. Submitted documents

**c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)**