



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 18, 2012

Ms. Melissa Garcia  
Office of General Counsel  
The University of Texas System  
201 West Seventh Street  
Austin, Texas 78701-2902

OR2012-20395

Dear Ms. Garcia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 474193 (OGC# 146680).

The University of Texas at San Antonio (the "university") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the university has released some of the responsive information. You state the university will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.<sup>2</sup>

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) provides, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). In this instance, the requestor has provided the university with two of the requisite pieces of information specified by the statute. Although you seek to withhold portions of this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, the exceptions found in the Act generally do not apply to information that is made public by other statutes. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 544 (1990), 378 (1983), 161 (1977), 146 (1976).

You also assert portions of the CR-3 form are confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or county. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in Act in applicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 of the Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451 (1986).

---

<sup>2</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

In this instance, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue in this request, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the university may not withhold any portion of the CR-3 form under section 552.130. Therefore, the university must release the CR-3 accident report form in its entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4).

We now turn to your arguments under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining information at issue. Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; [or]

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (b)(2). We note that the protections offered by subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(a)(2) are, generally, mutually exclusive. Subsection 552.108(a)(1) generally applies to information that pertains to criminal investigations or prosecutions that are currently pending, while subsection 552.108(a)(2) protects law enforcement records that pertain to criminal investigations and prosecutions that have concluded in final results other than criminal convictions or deferred adjudications. Additionally, subsection 552.108(b)(2) is applicable to information relating to a criminal investigation or prosecution that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably

explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108, .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You cite the statutory language of subsections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) of the Government Code and you state that the submitted report pertains to a criminal investigation by the university police department (the “department”) that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. You also provide, however, a letter from the chief of the department stating a criminal investigation is ongoing and criminal prosecution is pending. Because you have provided this office with conflicting representations, we are unable to determine whether the investigation relates to an ongoing criminal case or a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of subsections 552.108(a)(1), 552.108(a)(2), or 552.108(b)(2) to the information at issue; therefore, no information may be withheld on any of these bases.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”<sup>3</sup> Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”). Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See id.* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note the statutory definition of CHRI does not encompass driving record information maintained by DPS under subchapter C of chapter 521 of the Transportation Code. *See id.* § 411.082(2). We have marked CHRI the university must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and of no legitimate public interest.

---

<sup>3</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.101 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

*See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. Common-law privacy protects the specific types of information that are held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. *See id.* at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). This office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). We have marked medical information that is highly intimate or embarrassing and not a matter of legitimate public interest. The university must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

As noted above, section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. *See id.* § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle information under section 552.023 of the Government Code, and the university may not withhold it from her under section 552.130. The university, however, must withhold the driver's license information that belongs to other individuals, which we have marked, under section 552.130.

In summary, the university must release the submitted CR-3 accident report form in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. The university must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code and common-law privacy. The university must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The university must release the remaining information.<sup>4</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>4</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b). Therefore, if the university receives another request for this information from a person who does not have a special right of access to this information, the university should resubmit this same information and request another decision from this office. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Tamara H. Holland". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "T".

Tamara H. Holland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

THH/ac

Ref: ID# 474193

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)