



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 16, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2013-00992

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 480469.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You indicate the department will redact information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. You claim the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, the submitted report pertains to credit card abuse, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51. We note the requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft listed in the report, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, the submitted report is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent that it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the submitted report may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

You also seek to withhold a portion of the report under section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147(b) generally permits a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). In this case, article 2.29(b) provides this requestor with a right of access to all information in the submitted report that is not confidential. However, section 552.147 does not make information confidential by law. *See id.* § 552.147(a) (section 552.147 does not make the social security number of a living person confidential). Thus, in this case the department may not rely on section 552.147(b) of the Government Code to withhold the marked social security number. You also seek to withhold a portion of the report under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Because section 552.130 is a confidentiality provision, we will address the applicability of this provision to the submitted information.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(2). Upon review, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor pursuant to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/ac

Ref: ID# 480469

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)