



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 17, 2013

Mr. Elliot M. Barner
Counsel for the City of West University Place
Johnson, Radcliffe, Petrov & Bobbitt, PLLC
1001 McKinney, Suite 1000
Houston, Texas 77002-6424

OR2013-01027

Dear Mr. Barner:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 476890.

The West University Place Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for a named police officer's personnel file. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.152 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, you make no arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim this section applies to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302. Further, although you also raise section 552.1175 of the Government Code for some of the submitted information, we note section 552.117 of the Government Code is the proper exception to raise in this instance because the department holds the information at issue in an employment capacity. Additionally, although you raise section 552.151 of the Government Code, we note the 82nd Texas Legislature renumbered section 552.151 to section 552.152 of the Government Code. *See* Act of May 9, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1303, § 27.001(20).

²We assume the "representative sample" of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. This section makes confidential L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education (“TCLEOSE”). Section 1701.306 provides, in part:

(a) [TCLEOSE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCLEOSE]. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a), (b). The department must withhold the L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

(a) A polygraph examiner, trainee, or employee of a polygraph examiner, or a person for whom a polygraph examination is conducted or an employee of the person, may not disclose information acquired from a polygraph examination to another person other than:

(1) the examinee or any other person specifically designated in writing by the examinee;

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

- (2) the person that requested the examination;
- (3) a member, or the member's agent, of a governmental agency that licenses a polygraph examiner or supervises or controls a polygraph examiner's activities;
- (4) another polygraph examiner in private consultation; or
- (5) any other person required by due process of law.

(b) The [Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation] or any other governmental agency that acquires information from a polygraph examination under this section shall maintain the confidentiality of the information.

(c) A polygraph examiner to whom information acquired from a polygraph examination is disclosed under Subsection (a)(4) may not disclose the information except as provided by this section.

Id. § 1703.306. Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes information that was acquired from a polygraph examination and is, therefore, within the scope of section 1703.306. It does not appear the requestor falls into any of the categories of individuals who are authorized to receive the polygraph information under section 1703.306(a). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code.⁴ However, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the remaining information was acquired from a polygraph examination. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"). *Id.* §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Information taken directly from medical records and contained in other documents can be withheld in accordance with the MPA. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Upon review, we find none of the remaining information constitutes a medical record for purposes of the MPA. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in pertinent part:

(a) Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

(b) Confidential communications or records may not be disclosed except as provided by Section 611.004 or 611.0045.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a)-(b); *see id.* § 611.001 (defining "patient" and "professional"). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of a mental health record that is subject to chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Accordingly, the mental health record we have marked is confidential under chapter 611 and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.⁵ However, we find none of the remaining information consists of communications between a patient and a professional or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional. Accordingly, section 611.002 is not applicable to the remaining information, and the department may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain

⁵As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* § 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI that the department must withhold from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.⁶ However, we find that no portion of the remaining information constitutes CHRI. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code or federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which exempts a biometric identifier from disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 560.003. “Biometric identifier” means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry. *Id.* § 560.001. Section 560.002 of the Government Code provides that “[a] governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual . . . may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless . . . the individual consents to the disclosure[.]” *Id.* § 560.002(1)(A). You do not inform us, and the submitted information does not indicate, section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information in this instance. Therefore, the department must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.⁷

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered

⁶As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

⁷As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

to be intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We note the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See Open Records Decisions Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow).* Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find none of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.”⁸ Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we have marked the information that must be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov’t Code § 552.117(a). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Section 552.117 also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use).* Upon review, we find the department must withhold some of the remaining information, which we have marked, under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department only may withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental

⁸The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470.*

body.⁹ We find none of the remaining information consists of the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, or family member information of a peace officer. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license issued by a Texas agency, or an agency of another state or country, is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136. Section 552.136(a) defines "access device" as "a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument." *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the bank account and bank routing numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Id. § 552.152. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate that release of any of the remaining information would subject any employee to a substantial threat of harm. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.152.

In summary, the department must withhold the L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the polygraph information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the mental health record we have

⁹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 611.002 of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The department must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.¹⁰ The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department only may withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the bank account and bank routing numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sean Nottingham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SN/som

¹⁰We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination issued by this office authorizing all governmental bodies to withhold ten categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision, including L-2 and L-3 declarations under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code and fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Ref: ID# 476890

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)