



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 17, 2013

Ms. Cheryl K. Byles
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2013-01042

Dear Ms. Byles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 476320 (PIR No. W021085).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual, including information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the city has released some information to the requestor. You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. You claim section 552.101 in conjunction with the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989)

(when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). We also find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request, in part, seeks all information pertaining to the named individual. This aspect of the request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates this individual's privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted information relating to the incident specified by the requestor. Furthermore, you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information is not part of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of section 552.108 to this information.

We note the submitted information pertaining to the specified incident includes documents titled "Magistrate Warning" and "Election of Counsel" which are magistrate-signed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) requires disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless the information is confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). You raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information. However, this is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Record Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Accordingly, the city may not withhold the magistrate-signed documents under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As you raise no other exceptions for the magistrate-signed documents, the city must release the Magistrate Warning and Election of Counsel. However, we will consider the applicability of section 552.108 to the information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.*

§§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and have provided an affidavit from the city's police department showing, report number 12-88234 pertains to an active criminal investigation. Further, you state, and have provided an affidavit from the Tarrant County District Attorney's office showing, report number 12-48858 pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on these representations, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report numbers 12-88234 and 12-48858.

However, we note, and you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which you state you have released, the city may withhold report numbers 12-88234 and 12-48858 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the Magistrate Warning and Election of Counsel pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold report numbers 12-88234 and 12-48858 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

¹We note basic information includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Cynthia G. Tynan

Cynthia G. Tynan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CGT/akg

Ref: ID# 476320

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)