



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 7, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2013-02190

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 480701.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports involving the requestor at a specified address calling from a specified telephone number during a specified time period. You state the department will release some information to the requestor, including the submitted calls for service reports and a copy of the submitted El Paso County Detention Arrest Supplement. You indicate the department will redact driver's license information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and a Texas license plate number pursuant to Open Records Decision 684 (2009).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code authorizes governmental bodies to redact the information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130(a)(2) of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Initially, we note you have marked for redaction the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers in the submitted calls for service reports. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708 (2003), this office issued a previous determination authorizing the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Therefore, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information

under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find report 12-048197 and its corresponding calls for service report were used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of child abuse includes indecency with a child under Penal Code section 21.11); *see also* Penal Code § 21.11(a) (defining “child” for purposes of Penal Code section 21.11 as a person younger than 17 years of age). We note, however, the requestor is a parent of the child victim named in the information at issue, and the requestor is not accused of committing the alleged abuse. Accordingly, the department may not withhold from this requestor information concerning the alleged abuse that would otherwise be confidential under section 261.201(a). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Nonetheless, before the department provides information concerning report 12-048197, the department must redact any information that is otherwise excepted from required disclosure under the Act. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). As you raise section 552.108 for report 12-048197, we will address the applicability of this section to report 12-048197.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state reports 12-048197 and 12-305040 relate to pending criminal investigations. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to reports 12-048197 and 12-305040.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state reports 12-175223, 12-178190, and 12-272334 relate to criminal cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Thus, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to reports 12-175223, 12-178190, and 12-272334.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic front-page information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 127. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold reports 12-048197 and 12-305040 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and reports 12-175223, 12-178190, and 12-272334 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Lastly, we address your arguments under common-law and constitutional privacy for the remaining information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses to be excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy. You have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no

legitimate public interest, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See* ORD 455 at 4. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). After review of the remaining information, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

In summary, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold reports 12-048197 and 12-305040 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and reports 12-175223, 12-178190, and 12-272334 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Therefore, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from our office. Further, we note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). We note, however, the information contains the requestor's social security number, which may not be withheld in this instance. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sean Nottingham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SN/som

Ref: ID# 480701

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)