



**ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS**  
**GREG ABBOTT**

February 11, 2013

Mr. Carey E. Smith  
General Counsel  
Texas Health and Human Services Commission  
P.O. Box 13247  
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2013-02357

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 478521.

The Texas Health and Human Services Commission (the "commission") received a request for information regarding a specified investigation. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 531.1021 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(g) All information and materials subpoenaed or compiled by the [Office of the Inspector General of the Health and Human Services Commission (the "OIG")] in connection with an audit or investigation or by the office of the attorney general in connection with a Medicaid fraud investigation are confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act], and not subject to disclosure, discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for their release to anyone other than the office or the attorney general or their employees or agents involved in the audit or investigation conducted by the office or the attorney general, except that this information may be disclosed

to the state auditor's office, law enforcement agencies, and other entities as permitted by other law.

(h) A person who receives information under Subsection (g) may disclose the information only in accordance with Subsection (g) and in a manner that is consistent with the authorized purpose for which the person first received the information.

*Id.* § 531.1021(g), (h). You assert some of the submitted information is confidential under section 531.1021(g). Section 531.1021 is located in subchapter C of chapter 531 of the Government Code, titled "Medicaid and Other Health and Human Services Fraud, Abuse, or Overcharges." The legislature's amendment to section 531.1021(g) added express language stating information connected to investigations of Medicaid fraud is confidential. Section 531.102, also found in subchapter C, further specifies the OIG "is responsible for the investigation of fraud and abuse in the provision of health and human services[.]" *Id.* § 531.102(a). Thus, subchapter C addresses the responsibilities of the OIG in conducting investigations of Medicaid and other health and human services fraud and abuse. Therefore, section 531.1021 applies only to audits and investigations of Medicaid and other health and human services fraud and abuse. The information at issue consists of documents related to an internal personnel investigation into the alleged misconduct of multiple employees. We find this information is not related to Medicaid or other health and human services fraud, abuse, or overcharges. Therefore, the commission may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> *Id.* §§ 552.117(a)(1), .024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the commission may only withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. To the extent the employees concerned timely elected to keep such information confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the commission must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the Government Code. To the extent these employees did not make timely elections, the commission may not withhold the marked information on this basis.<sup>2</sup>

We note the information at issue contains a personal e-mail address. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address listed in the information at issue is not specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). As such, this e-mail address, which we have marked, must be withheld under section 552.137, unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release.<sup>3</sup> *See id.* § 552.137(b).

In summary, to the extent the employees concerned timely elected to keep such information confidential, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. To the extent the employees did not make timely elections, the commission may not withhold the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The commission must withhold the personal e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release. The remaining information must be released.<sup>4</sup>

You ask this office to issue a previous determination with regard to investigations by the OIG under section 531.1021 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.301(a) (allowing governmental body to withhold information subject to previous determination); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup>Regardless of the applicability of section 552.117, section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

<sup>3</sup>Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) serves as a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including e-mail addresses of members of the public under section 552.137, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

<sup>4</sup>We note that the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the commission receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the commission must again seek a ruling from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'VB', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Vanessa Burgess  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

VB/dls

Ref: ID# 478521

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)