



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 25, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2013-03137

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 479642.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information regarding a named individual. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision" and encompasses information made confidential by statute. Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy

interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to a named individual. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, you have submitted information in which the named individual is not listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate the individual's right to privacy. Accordingly, we will address your arguments for this information.

We note common-law privacy also protects other types of information. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Indus. Found*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we conclude you have not explained how any of the submitted information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A). Therefore, the department may not withhold

any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated in the submitted information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/ag

¹We note the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold the social security number of a living individual without the necessity of seeking a ruling from this office under the Act. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Ref: ID# 479642

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)