



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 25, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, Ninth Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2013-03162

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 483331.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records related to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 51.03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). Section 58.007 provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we agree the submitted documents involve juvenile delinquent conduct occurring after September 1, 1997. Therefore, the submitted information is subject to section 58.007. However, the requestor is the parent of one of the juvenile offenders listed in the submitted report and has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning her child pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Section 58.007(j)(2) provides, however, that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your claim under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is generally applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975)(court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes an arrestee’s name, race, sex, age, occupation, address, physical condition, and social security number and a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD127. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1).¹

Next, we understand the department to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the basic information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore,

¹As our ruling for this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against its release.

no portion of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We further note section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code provides that any personally identifiable information concerning other juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses must be redacted. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(j)(1). The basic information contains personally identifiable information of juvenile arrestees who are not children of the requestor. Accordingly, the department must withhold any personally identifiable information concerning any juvenile offender who is not a child of the requestor from the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.² In releasing basic information, the department must withhold any personally identifiable information concerning any juvenile offender who is not a child of the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACV/ag

²Because the requestor has a right of access to information being released in this instance, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

Ref: ID# 483331

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)