



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 12, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-05950

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 483815.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports for a specified address for the year 2012. You state the department will release some of the requested information. You claim some of the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

¹Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct"), (b) (defining "conduct indicating a need for supervision" to include "the voluntary absence of a child from the child's home without the consent of the child's parent or guardian for a substantial length of time or without intent to return"). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or offender.

Report number 12-133164 involves a child engaged in conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. As such, this information is subject to section 58.007(c). However, the submitted information reflects the requestor is a parent of

the juvenile offender. Therefore, in accordance with section 58.007(e), this report may not be withheld from this requestor under section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or law must be redacted. *Id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, we will address your remaining argument against disclosure of report number 12-133164. Upon review, we find none of the remaining reports identify a juvenile suspect or offender for the purposes of section 58.007. Accordingly, we find the department has not demonstrated the applicability of section 58.007(c) to this information; thus the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Whether information is subject to a legitimate public interest and therefore not protected by common-law privacy must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See Open Records Decision No. 373* (1983). We note this office has found that names, telephone numbers, and addresses are not excepted from public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision No. 455* at 7 (1987). You state certain identifying information in report number 12-133164 is protected under common-law privacy. Upon review, we find you have failed to establish the information you seek to withhold under common-law privacy is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public; therefore, this information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report number 12-361203 pertains to pending criminal investigation by the department. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude release of report number 12-361203 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report number 12-361203.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing the types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense information, the department may withhold report number 12-361203 under section 552.108(a)(1).²

We note the remaining information contains an e-mail address of a member of the public.³ Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address we have marked is not one of the types specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 unless the owner of the address affirmatively consents to its release.⁴

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report number 12-361203 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code unless the owner of the address affirmatively consents to its release. The department must release the remaining information.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument under section 552.130 of the Government Code, except to note that basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* does not include information subject to section 552.130.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

⁴We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁵We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b). However, the requestor has a right to his minor son’s social security number. See generally *id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person’s representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Lindsay E. Hale". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/tch

Ref: ID# 483815

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)