



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 16, 2013

Ms. Michelle L. Villarreal
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2013-06133

Dear Ms. Villarreal:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 485488 (LGL No. 13-195).

The City of Waco (the "city") received a request for the dash cam video from a specified traffic stop. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's responsibilities under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(b). The city received the request for information on February 4, 2012. You state February 18, 2013, was a federal holiday and there was "no mail run." However, you do not inform us the city was closed for business on that date. Thus, the city was required to request a decision from this office by February 18, 2013. The envelope in which the city submitted its request for a ruling bears a postmark of February 19, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the city has failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). We note section 552.108 of the Government Code is discretionary in nature. This exception serves only to protect a governmental body's interests, and may be waived; as such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.108. We note portions of the submitted information are subject to section 552.101 and section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Because section 552.101 and section 552.130 can provide compelling reasons to withhold information, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family code, which provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Under section 58.007, law enforcement records relating to a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is a person who was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information consists of a law enforcement record of a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision on or after September 1, 1997. Therefore, we find the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). We note, however, the requestor is a parent of the juvenile suspect in the information at issue. As such, the requestor has a right of access under section 58.007(e) to law enforcement records concerning her child. *Id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address the applicability of section 552.130 to the submitted information.

We note portions of the submitted video recording are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We note the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates

or person's agent on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, with the exception of the requestor's motor vehicle record information, we find the city must withhold the audible and discernible driver's license and license plate information from the submitted video recording under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the city must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

Ref: ID# 485488

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²Because this requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, if the city receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the city must again seek a decision from this office.