



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 22, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-06496

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 484759.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for documents pertaining to five specified cases. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you seek to withhold information relating to 9-1-1 callers. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708 (2003), this office issued a previous determination that authorizes the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)). Therefore, to the extent the information you have marked consists of the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that were furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the submitted information pertains to concluded cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on your representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes, among other items, an identification and description of the complainant, but does not include identifying information of a victim, unless the victim is also the complainant. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. We also note the submitted information includes call sheet reports. In Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996), this office concluded information contained in a computer-assisted dispatch (“CAD”) report is substantially the same as basic information. *See* ORD 649 at 3; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 394 at 3 (1983) (there is no qualitative difference between information contained in radio cards or radio logs and front-page offense report information expressly held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*; thus, such information is generally public). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

We understand you to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the basic information. Section 552.101 excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded, generally, only that information which either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably

intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No. 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Although you argue the basic information should be withheld in its entirety, you have not demonstrated, and the submitted information does not reflect, this is a situation in which all of the information must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. In addition, we find the department has failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You also seek to withhold the basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5, 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village*, Tex., 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the basic information falls within the constitutional zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Thus, no portion of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

In summary, to the extent the information you marked consists of the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that were furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michelle R. Garza", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

Ref: ID# 484759

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)