



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 1, 2013

Mr. Mark Henkes
County Attorney
County of Hamilton
P.O. Box 706
Hamilton, Texas 76531

OR2013-07206

Dear Mr. Henkes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 485900.

The Hamilton County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for reports pertaining to any of ten specified offenses that occurred during a specified period of time.¹ You state you have released some of the responsive information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have submitted information other than reports. Therefore, this information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the present request. The sheriff's office need not release non-responsive information in response to the request, and this ruling will not address that information.

¹You indicate the sheriff's office sought and received clarification of the request for information. See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (stating that if information requested is unclear to governmental body or if a large amount of information has been requested, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify or narrow request, but may not inquire into purpose for which information will be used); *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date the request is clarified or narrowed).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find some of the submitted reports were used or developed in investigations of the alleged or suspected abuse or neglect of children under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* §§ 261.001 (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code chapter 261 to include sexual assault and aggravated sexual assault under Penal Code sections 22.011 and 22.021), 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes); *see also* Penal Code §§ 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of Penal Code sections 22.011 and 22.021 as person under 17 years of age), .021(b)(1). You have not indicated the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information we have marked is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

²As our ruling is dispositive of this information, we need address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (2). As a general rule, the protections afforded by subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(a)(2) are mutually exclusive. Section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to information pertaining to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution, while section 552.108(a)(2) protects law enforcement records pertaining to a criminal investigation or prosecution that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why claimed exceptions to disclosure apply); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state the remaining reports in Exhibits B and C relate to pending criminal investigations. You state some of these reports also relate to pending criminal prosecutions in the 220th District Court of Hamilton County (the "district court"). Accordingly, we understand you to raise section 552.108(a)(1) for the information at issue. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense, the location of the crime, and the identifying information and description of the complainant, but does not include identifying information of a victim, unless the victim is also the complainant. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining reports in Exhibits B and C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in relevant part as follows:

³As our ruling for this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The purpose of section 552.103 is to protect the litigation interests of governmental bodies that are parties to the litigation at issue. *See id.* § 552.103(a); Open Records Decision No. 638 at 2 (1996) (section 552.103 only protects the litigation interests of the governmental body claiming the exception). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show section 552.103(a) is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). ORD 551 at 4.

You inform us the remaining responsive information in Exhibit D relates to pending prosecutions before the district court. However, we note the sheriff's office is not a party to the litigation and, therefore, does not have a litigation interest in the matter for purposes of section 552.103. *See* Gov't Code § 552.103(a); Open Records Decision No. 575 at 2 (1990) (stating that predecessor to section 552.103 only applies when governmental body is party to litigation). In such a situation, we require an affirmative representation from the governmental body with the litigation interest that the governmental body wants the information at issue withheld from disclosure under section 552.103. However, you have not provided this office with an affirmative representation from a governmental body with a litigation interest explaining that it seeks to withhold the information at issue pursuant to section 552.103. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue in Exhibit D under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to

the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded that, generally, only information which either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other serious sex-related offense may be withheld under common law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). Additionally, in those instances where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the victim, the entire report must be withheld to protect the victim's privacy.

You argue some of the remaining responsive information should be withheld in its entirety on the basis of common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which any portion of the information at issue must be withheld in its entirety on the basis of common-law privacy. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold the any of the information at issue in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. However, upon review, we find portions of the remaining responsive information are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold that information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴ Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception, such as section 552.130, on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

remaining reports in Exhibits B and C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

Ref: ID# 485900

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁵We note the information to be released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).