



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 10, 2013

Mr. Matthew B. Cross
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2013-07805

Dear Mr. Cross:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 487067.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified police report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only the information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy. However,

a governmental body is required to withhold an entire report when identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information or when the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 393 (1983), 339 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). The requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim in the submitted offense report. Thus, withholding only the identifying information from the requestor would not preserve the victim's common-law right to privacy. Therefore, we conclude the submitted information is generally confidential in its entirety pursuant to the common-law privacy principles incorporated by section 552.101 of the Government Code.

However, the requestor is with the Adult Protective Services ("APS") division of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services ("DFPS"). Under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code, DFPS's duties include the investigation of abuse, neglect, or exploitation in the provision of services to an elderly or disabled person. *See* Hum. Res. Code §§ 48.151, .152. Section 48.154(a) of the Human Resources Code provides as follows:

The [DFPS] or another state agency, as appropriate, shall have access to any records or documents, including client-identifying information, financial records, and medical and psychological records, necessary to the performance of the [DFPS]'s or state agency's duties under this chapter. The duties include but are not limited to the investigation of abuse, neglect, or exploitation or the provisions of services to an elderly or disabled person. A person, agency, or institution that has a record or document that the [DFPS] or state agency needs to perform its duties under this chapter shall, without unnecessary delay, make the record or document available to the [DFPS] or state agency that requested the record or document.

Id. § 48.154(a). The requestor states APS is requesting the records at issue. Consequently, we understand DFPS is in need of this information in order to perform its duties under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code, which include investigation of abuse, neglect, or exploitation of a disabled person. *See id.* §§ 48.151, .152. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to the information pursuant to section 48.154. A statutory right of access generally prevails over the common law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, because the requestor's statutory right of access prevails over common-law privacy, none of the submitted information may be withheld on privacy grounds. In addition, a specific statutory right-of-access provision prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure, such as section 552.108. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989), 451 at 4 (1986). Thus, the department may not withhold the information at issue

from this requestor based on section 552.108. Therefore, the department must release the submitted information to the requestor pursuant to section 48.154(a) of the Human Resources Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/bhf

Ref: ID# 487067

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹Because the requestor has a special right of access under section 48.154 to information that would ordinarily be protected by section 552.101 of the Government Code, the department must request another ruling if it receives a request for this same information from another requestor. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.